DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 430 874 SO 030 582

AUTHOR Powney, Janet; McPake, Joanna; Hall, Stuart; Lyall, Lindsay

TITLE Education of Minority Ethnic Groups in Scotland: A Review of Research. SCRE Research Report No. 88.

INSTITUTION Scottish Council for Research in Education, Edinburgh.
SPONS AGENCY Scottish Office Education and Industry Dept., Edinburgh.
ISBN ISBN-1-86003-042-4
PUB DATE 1998-00-00
NOTE 99p.
AVAILABLE FROM Scottish Council for Research in Education, 15 St. John Street, Edinburgh, Scotland EH8 8JR.
PUB TYPE Reports - Research (143)
EDRS PRICE EDRS Price MF01 Plus Postage. PC Not Available from EDRS.
DESCRIPTORS Educational Research; Elementary Secondary Education; Equal Education; Ethnic Groups; Evaluation; Foreign Countries; *Minority Groups; *Research and Development
IDENTIFIERS *Scotland

ABSTRACT

This review examines research done and information made available regarding the education of minority ethnic groups in Scotland. Compilers of the review used and commented on available statistical information and Scottish studies relevant to minority ethnic groups and their education at all levels. The intent of the review was to determine whether people from minority ethnic groups living in Scotland receive equitable treatment in the Scottish educational system. The review concludes that some attention has been paid to the development of policies supporting the education of children, young people, and adults from minority ethnic groups. However, there is scant monitoring or evaluation in this area and little major funding to research in this field. Research has been directed more towards raising awareness than towards rigorous investigation. Priorities regarding future research, monitoring, and evaluation are identified. (Contains 212 references.) (MM)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED 430 874

Education of Minority Ethnic Groups in Scotland

A Review of Research

Janet Powney
Joanna McPake
Stuart Hall
Lindsay Lyall

SCRE RESEARCH REPORT SERIES

SO 030 582

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE AND IN ELECTRONIC MEDIA FOR ERIC COLLECTION SUBSCRIBERS ONLY, HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

R. Wake

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

2A

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

SCRE 2

Education of Minority Ethnic Groups in Scotland

A Review of Research

Janet Powney
Joanna McPake
Stuart Hall
Lindsay Lyall

SCRE
The Scottish Council for Research in Education

SCRE Research Report No 88

ISBN 1 86003 042 4

Copyright © 1998 The Scottish Council for Research in Education

First published November 1998

A report arising from a review carried out between January and June 1998 for the Scottish Office Education and Industry Department by the Scottish Council for Research in Education.

The views expressed are those of the authors and are not necessarily those of the Scottish Council for Research in Education or the Scottish Office Education and Industry Department.

Printed and bound by the Scottish Council for Research in Education, 15 St John Street, Edinburgh EH8 8JR.

Contents

		Page
	ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vi
	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	vii-xiii
1	BACKGROUND AND INTRODUCTION	1
	Summary	1
	Introduction	1
	Procedures for the review	1
	Scottish research	2
2	NOTES ON TERMINOLOGY	4
	Summary	4
	Minority ethnic groups	4
	Minority group 'labels'	4
	'Race' and racism	5
	Multicultural and anti-racist education	6
	Bilingualism	7
	Community Languages	7
	English as a Second Language	8
3	STATISTICAL SOURCES	9
	Summary	9
	Problems of collecting statistics	9
	School populations	11
	Further and higher education	12
	Emerging research issues	13
4	ACCESS	14
	Summary	14
	Introduction	14
	Access and young people of school age	14
	Access and post compulsory education	17
	Emerging research issues	20
5	LEARNING AND TEACHING: ETHOS	21
	Summary	21
	Commitment to multicultural and anti-racist education	21
	School ethos and teacher attitude	22
	Expectations and stereotyping	23
	Teachers' knowledge and understanding	23
	Racism in Scotland and in Scottish schools	24
	Conclusion	27
	Emerging research issues	28

6	**LEARNING AND TEACHING: THE CURRICULUM**	29
	Summary	29
	Scottish curricula	29
	Emerging research issues	30
7	**LEARNING AND TEACHING: HOME AND SCHOOL**	31
	Summary	31
	Home and school	31
	Parents' expectations	32
	Communication between school and home	32
	Pupils with special educational needs	33
	Emerging research issues	34
8	**LEARNING AND TEACHING: LANGUAGE ISSUES**	35
	Summary	35
	Bilingualism and education	35
	'Community' language provision	37
	English as a second language	38
	Language, culture and access to resources	39
	Emerging research issues	40
9	**LEARNING AND TEACHING: TEACHER EDUCATION AND STAFF DEVELOPMENT**	41
	Summary	41
	Recruitment	41
	Initial teacher education	42
	Staff development	43
	Emerging research issues	43
10	**ATTAINMENT**	45
	Summary	45
	Introduction	46
	School attainment	46
	Achievement in further and higher education	49
	Factors influencing patterns of attainment	50
	Emerging research issues	53
11	**ETHNICITY AND EDUCATIONAL EMPLOYMENT**	55
	Summary	55
	Further and higher education	55
	Factors influencing educational careers of staff from minority groups	56
	The school sector	59
	Emerging research issues	60

12 **METHODOLOGY** 61
Summary 61
Methods used in Scottish educational research 61
Quantitative methods and minority ethnic groups in Scotland 62
Sub-groups and problems of access 62
Issues arising from UK wide research 63
Ethnic background of researchers — a variable 64
Emerging research issues 65

13 **TOWARDS A NEW RESEARCH AGENDA** 66
Monitoring information 66
Access 67
Learning and teaching: ethos 67
Learning and teaching: the curriculum 68
Learning and teaching: home and school 68
Learning and teaching: language issues 69
Learning and teaching: teacher education and staff development 69
Attainment 69
Ethnicity and educational employment 70
Methodology 70

REFERENCES 71-82

APPENDICES

Acknowledgements

The team would like to thank colleagues throughout Scotland who have contributed references and ideas for this review and especially towards a future agenda for research related to the education of people from minority ethnic groups. We are also grateful for the help given by Owen Edwards during his work experience placement at SCRE.

Executive summary

This research review was commissioned by the Scottish Office Education and Industry Department to provide information about education and minority ethnic groups in Scotland, arising from research completed in Scotland and elsewhere. The authors of the review have used and commented on available statistical information and any Scottish studies relevant to minority ethnic groups and education at all levels. Consideration is also given to issues of methodology pertinent to the conduct of policy related research on ethnicity in the Scottish context. Priorities for future research, monitoring and evaluation are identified by drawing on the Scottish work and comparative relevant research from outwith Scotland. The key issue for research in this area is whether people from minority ethnic groups get a fair deal from the education system in Scotland.

The researchers conclude that some attention has been paid in Scotland to the development of policy supporting the education of children, young people and adults from minority ethnic groups. However, there is scant monitoring or evaluation in this area. There has been little major funding allocated to research in this field. Most has been carried out on a small scale, often by committed researchers operating with low or even non-existent budgets. On the whole, research has been directed more towards awareness raising than to rigorous investigation.

Notes on terminology

The history of the study of 'race' issues is encapsulated in the many debates around terminology such as 'Race' and 'racism', 'multi-cultural education' and 'anti-racism', 'bilingualism', 'community languages' and 'English as a Second Language'. For the purposes of this review, the term 'minority ethnic' has been used since the term 'ethnic minority' suggests that only minority groups have any 'ethnicity'.

Statistical sources

A major problem confronting policy makers and researchers concerned with minority ethnic groups is the lack of accessible statistical information on which to base enquiry and conclusions. Such information as exists is patchy. Not all authorities collect statistical information; available statistics vary among authorities both in the areas addressed and the period over which the information has been collected. There are nevertheless examples of effective data collection in some areas of Scotland. After attempts in the period 1994-96, the Scottish Office discontinued collecting data on the ethnicity of primary and secondary pupils in Scotland due to the unreliability of the data.

It is frequently assumed that the relatively low numbers of people from minority ethnic groups living in Scotland mean that it is not worthwhile to negotiate the difficulties of collecting data.

Access to education by students from minority ethnic groups

Parents from minority ethnic groups may have high educational aspirations for their children but in some localities it is difficult for them to find sufficient, accessible information and career advice about their children's educational opportunities. This can apply to all levels from pre-school to post-compulsory education.

For example, Scottish research has also shown a lack of accessible information and problems with admissions processes in relation to minority ethnic involvement in higher education. However, there is little Scottish research into access and exclusion in school. Children from black groups tend to be over-represented in school exclusion records in England but there is no equivalent Scottish research concerned with exclusions and ethnicity.

Studies have also revealed problems with the general ethos of higher education institutions in the sense that curricula largely ignore minority ethnic experience and culture and there may be covert or overt forms of discrimination. Students from minority ethnic groups can feel isolated.

Across the UK, there are higher participation rates in post-compulsory education from minority ethnic groups as a whole compared with the white population: Asians are ten times more likely to stay on than white groups. There are differences in staying on rates between different minority groups that cannot be explained only in terms of social class. However, the higher education experiences of minority ethnic students in English higher education cannot be accepted as necessarily relevant to Scotland given the nature and distribution of the Scottish minority ethnic population.

Learning and teaching: ethos

Almost every agency concerned with education for schools and teachers advocates addressing issues concerned with the education of minority ethnic groups. Despite these exhortations, there has been no distinctively Scottish agenda of major research related to learning and teaching in the context of a pluralistic society although there is a clear need for it. Evidence suggests that from pre-school to post-school settings in Scotland, teachers' interactions with pupils can disadvantage those from minority ethnic backgrounds. There is some evidence to suggest that school ethos can endorse the view that racism is acceptable. A major concern for teaching is therefore how to avoid stereotypical expectations and adapt methods of learning and teaching to the needs of all pupils, including those from minority ethnic groups.

Scotland has made significant contributions to thinking and development related to school ethos. However, while racism remains a neglected issue, research does not provide teachers with evidence on which to base anti-racist strategies.

Learning and teaching: the curriculum

The school curriculum has two responsibilities in relation to minority ethnic groups. One is to ensure that the curriculum itself is accessible to pupils from minority ethnic backgrounds, through the materials used in learning and teaching. The other is to ensure that explicit and hidden curricula are anti-racist and do not endorse prejudice and discrimination.

Issues related to the curriculum and curriculum materials are largely neglected in research focused on education of minority ethnic groups. In particular, there is a lack of monitoring of the implementation of 5-14 in relation to learning and teaching of pupils from minority ethnic groups.

Learning and teaching: home and school

Mismatches between parents' and teachers' understanding of the philosophies and practices of schools and schooling are likely to affect the learning of children from minority ethnic backgrounds but there is relatively little Scottish research into the perspectives of minority ethnic parents on their children's education. The concerns and interests that these parents are likely to have about their children's education will be, in many respects, similar to those of all parents; but there will also be other issues, specific to different groups.

The research available suggests that parents from minority ethnic groups tend to have high aspirations for their children's education and career choices although information and publicity materials relating to the various education sectors rarely target minority ethnic communities specifically and consequently parents from these communities are not always well informed about the options and choices available to their children. Moreover, teachers and other educational professionals are not always aware of the particular concerns and expectations of parents from minority ethnic groups.

Particularly in relation to the identification of children with special educational needs, there is evidence that parental involvement in the process is hampered by lack of attention to linguistic issues and of suitable resources (such as trained interpreters).

Learning and teaching: language issues

While many different languages are spoken by some pupils in Scotland, there is little research investigating the effects of bilingualism on learning. More attention has been paid to provision for English as a second language (ESL) than to providing opportunities for pupils to develop their skills in community languages.

Bilingualism has been shown to have positive effects on children's educational development. However, American research suggests that failure to develop children's skills in both languages can have detrimental effects. In the UK, bilingual education for Welsh and Gaelic speakers is well established but has never been a serious proposition for bilingual children from minority ethnic

backgrounds. Support for bilingual children's development of both (or all) their languages at primary level is growing, particularly in England. There appears to be little research into Scottish practice in this regard, despite a degree of commitment at national level.

Formal provision for community language teaching is made mainly in the secondary, community and adult education sectors but again there has been very little research in Scotland into the language needs and interests of minority ethnic communities.

Greater attention at UK level has been paid to provision to support bilingual children's acquisition of English. English as a Second Language (ESL) support is less generously funded in Scotland than in England and research on the effects of such provision has been mainly on a small-scale.

Learning and teaching: teacher education and staff development

The quality of the teaching force is likely to be the major factor in providing a good education for all pupils. In relation to the education of minority ethnic groups, both the composition of the teaching force and the way teachers promote multi-cultural and anti-racist education are vital. Research areas relevant to teacher education are recruitment into the profession from minority ethnic groups as well as the content, access, and experiences of programmes of initial and inservice training. There is little Scottish research published in any of these areas.

Racism or discrimination has been evident in teaching placements for trainee teachers from minority groups in England. English research also suggests that teacher training programmes have been slow to respond to the changing populations and needs of schools and that action is required in relation to minority ethnic groups and anti-racism in the following areas: admissions policy, administrative structures, school liaison, course content and staffing policy. There is an absence of research in Scotland relating to any of these areas and little attention is being paid to the long term effects of initial and inservice multi-cultural and anti-racist programmes on teachers' subsequent practice and their pupils' learning.

Attainment

The Scottish research contribution to the debate on school attainment of students from minority ethnic groups is limited, reflecting individual interests in particular themes rather than being a systematic and cumulative development of a body of research.

Much of the relevant research has taken place outwith Scotland where, for example, concern has been raised about the under-achievement of African-Caribbeans, particularly males, and of some South Asian groups in school. Indeed there is evidence to suggest a widening of the gap between those

minority ethnic groups who were succeeding and those who were doing less well academically over the last few years.

Empirical research carried out in Scotland often fails to achieve sufficiently large samples to deal with the number of variables involved in looking at ethnicity and attainment. Consequently it is not possible to make definitive statements about the relationships between ethnicity and school attainment. Increased monitoring of achievement by minority ethnic groups at school, is needed.

On a UK basis Chinese, Black-Africans and Other-Asians are overall the groups most likely, and the Pakistani, Bangladeshi and Black-Caribbeans least likely, to hold a higher education qualification. Little research has been conducted in Scotland on attainment of minority ethnic groups in further and higher education. Until recently, figures for ethnicity have not been published centrally making such research particularly difficult. There is some research evidence that some HEIs have been less than willing to co-operate with such studies.

Research shows that factors that correlate with low attainment, such as unemployment, poverty, and poor housing, are more likely to affect minority ethnic populations in Scotland than their white counterparts. Most of the major empirical studies indicating the correlation between social class and differential educational achievement have either taken place in England or on a UK wide basis. Even in these studies the links between social class, ethnicity and educational achievement are less well developed than research into social class and attainment.

Ethnicity and educational employment

There is considerable scope for extending monitoring information concerning recruitment and levels of appointment of minority ethnic staff in all sectors of education. Statistics associating ethnicity and educational employment in Scotland are 'virtually invisible'. General Scottish employment statistics in various sectors show that black workers are under-represented compared to their share of the population in both male and female dominated services. Further, where black workers are employed, they often remain at the lowest grades. It appears that equal opportunities legislation has had little impact as yet on the employment patterns of staff from minority ethnic groups employed in education in Scotland.

Most advertisements for staff mention that employers have an equal opportunities policy yet there is little subsequent research related to ethnicity and equal opportunities, or issues of multiple discrimination, in relation to staff educational appointments and promotion in Scotland.

Research methods

Existing Scottish research into the education of minority ethnic groups in Scotland has made use of a wide range of standard social science research and evaluation approaches. There are also considerations of what might be special

circumstances relating to Scotland compared with the rest of the UK. Researchers with an interest in this field face a number of difficulties:

- Much statistical data routinely collected in Scotland does not include ethnicity as a variable. Audit and statistical analyses are therefore limited.
- The small numbers of people from minority subgroups and the distinctive nature of these different groups can make it difficult to find reasonable sized samples or to produce findings that are generalisable.
- It has proved difficult to gain access to some minority ethnic groups partly because of the nature of the selected sample.

It is not sufficient to depend on UK wide research since this may obscure differences between sub-groups of minority ethnic populations including those living in Scotland. In contrast there is the danger of over generalising from small scale studies.

The studies carried out in Scotland as well as the rest of the UK make little concession to the influence of the ethnic backgrounds of the researchers on data collection and interpretation of findings.

The overall picture of educational research related to minority ethnic groups in Scotland reflects a problem based approach with theoretical assumptions remaining implicit. In developing a strategy for future research and priorities in this area, attention will also need to be given to ways of supporting appropriate and rigorous methods.

Towards a new research agenda

Most Scottish research in the area of education and minority ethnic groups has been small scale, conducted by committed and enthusiastic, individuals usually with minimal resources. Research in this area has tended to be pragmatic, problem-based and focused on local issues. There has been little theoretical debate concerning education and minority groups such as that which has stimulated shifts in the emphasis of research and educational provision in England from multi-cultural to anti-racist issues. A strategy for ensuring that there is support for all researchers to deploy appropriate and rigorous methods as well as for defining priorities for research topics is required.

Given the paucity of existing research concerning the education of pupils and students from minority ethnic groups, a possible research agenda emerges as a very long shopping list. Throughout the review we have tried to identify key issues and topics emerging from research undertaken so far in Scotland and elsewhere. Listed at the end of the full report is a combination of issues arising directly from the review and from suggestions put forward by key informants consulted in the course of the work. While the agenda is long, that does not mean it is comprehensive. Rather it is intended to convey to a variety of audiences the breadth of issues that require further attention.

A first step is to establish a firm data base about access, participation and achievement by minority ethnic groups in different sectors of education. It is also important to review the implementation of the many policies designed to promote fairness for all students educated in Scotland. How do those working within education take account of the cultures and experiences of minority communities, for example, in relation to curricula, teaching methods, assessment and parents' expectations? The recruitment, appointment and support of staff from minority groups present related issues.

About 50 languages other than English are spoken in Scotland and yet there is little information on the implications of bilingualism for learning. Local authorities also put considerable resources into supporting competence in English as a second (or other) language and a map of provision and good practices in this area would be of considerable benefit.

Initial and inservice teacher education programmes are vital in promoting education for pupils from minority ethnic groups but it is not only teachers who influence educational experiences and subsequent careers. Non-teaching staff within schools and colleges have a role to play and so do those who are in other services related to education such as HMI, education authority staff, psychological and school health services. To what extent are the needs of minority ethnic groups taken into account by such people and what promotes or inhibits good service provision in these contexts?

Finally researchers might reflect on three particular areas of their own practices: the extent to which ethnicity can be included in any research project's data collection and analyses; the effects of the researchers' ethnic origins on their investigations; and the need to develop a strategy for enhancing the quality and quantity of educational research related to minority ethnic groups in Scotland.

1 Background and Introduction

Summary

While some attention has been paid in Scotland to policy in relation to the education of children, young people and adults from minority ethnic groups, there is scant monitoring or evaluation in this area. There has been little major funding allocated to research in this field. What exists tends to be small scale often carried out by committed researchers operating on small or even non-existent budgets. On the whole, research has been directed more towards awareness raising than to rigorous investigation.

Introduction

Studies relating to the education of minority ethnic groups in England are both detailed and wide-ranging. There has been little comparable research in Scotland. This review was commissioned by the Scottish Office Education and Industry Department, to focus on such information and research relating to minority ethnic education as is available in Scotland, and also on issues arising from research from elsewhere which has relevance for the Scottish situation.

Specifically, this research review focuses on:

- the availability of pertinent statistical information
- the subject, scope, findings and usefulness of Scottish studies relating to all levels of education
- comparative relevant research from outwith Scotland
- priorities for further research in Scotland relevant to the education and training of minority ethnic groups
- research methodologies and methodological issues pertinent to the conduct of valid and reliable policy-related research on ethnicity within the Scottish context.

Procedures for the review

Information on statistical data was sought from local authorities, Scottish Qualifications Authority, and the Scottish Office Statistical Unit, Commission for Racial Equality and the various teaching unions. Scottish and UK databases were searched for research related to the education of minority ethnic groups and the published resources used comprise nearly 200 items including research reports, opinion papers, theoretical papers and other reviews mostly published in the last fifteen years.

Given the scarcity of research and the difficulty of finding reports of some of the studies which have been carried out, we are indebted to personal contacts with colleagues in all sectors of education and organisations concerned with the education of people from minority ethnic groups. They provided us with leads on completed and ongoing projects and suggestions for priorities for

future research, aimed both at addressing gaps in knowledge and at developing future monitoring activities. As so much of the Scottish research in this area is small scale, some studies will not have been published but remain hidden away as dissertations for BEd and MEd. Hopefully this review will encourage authors to add them to databases of research concerned with education and minority ethnic groups.

Scottish research

Almost all the Scottish research in this area is small scale, and most studies directly related to minority ethnic education in Scotland are published as monographs with few reaching the mainstream literature. Work has largely been undertaken on a personal basis, as part of a higher degree award and/or by researchers who have a particular interest in the outcomes. There is a particular difficulty in finding research that has used adequate sample sizes for quantitative research. Many studies have been based on largely untested assumptions about underachievement and cultural or linguistic problems. Evidence from these studies can sometimes be contradictory as their scale limits comparisons between one piece of research and another.

Reference is made to research carried out in Great Britain or the UK but caution is necessary in interpreting findings from these studies. Scottish populations may have been included in some UK-wide studies, but what is more important is that insufficient attention is paid to the distinctive characteristics of minority groups in Scotland and the general Scottish context. In England, the size, composition, geographical spread, and socio-economic position of minority ethnic groups in Scotland does not mirror those south of the border. For example, while many English cities have sizeable populations of people of African-Caribbean origin the same cannot be said of Scotland: for example, Glasgow, with a population of over six hundred thousand people of minority ethnic origin, has only 217 African-Caribbeans (1991 census). Equally it is argued that the socio-economic position of people from minority ethnic groups in Scotland is, on average, better than in England. Such factors are likely to affect the educational context differently. However English research does suggest issues for future Scottish research in this field.

The broad themes for the review arose from such Scottish research as was available with additional material and comparative studies culled from other UK published research. It does not represent an exhaustive survey of the international research literature on the education of minority ethnic groups or of anti-racist education. No attempt was made, for example, to include the prolific amount of research available in the USA on the education of people from minority ethnic groups other than in terms of general background to our thinking.

Issues relating to the education of minority ethnic groups are not separate to those which affect everyone. We are concerned in this review not only with the particular features which distinguish minority ethnic groups from the

majority (e.g. linguistic or cultural differences) but also with how they fare within the Scottish education system. Children's learning is in part determined by the attitudes of the dominant white Scottish population and the conceptual framework for education which has been determined by that dominant group. Necessarily this review must address issues concerning the curriculum and the learning context, and therefore includes experiences of discrimination and racism as part of the environment in which children from minority ethnic groups are educated.

The key issue for researchers is whether people from minority ethnic groups get a fair deal from the education system in Scotland. To what extent has the situation for minority groups improved as a consequence of the various helpful guidelines and suggestions on, for example, implementing 5-14, improving school ethos, enhancing and recognising pupils' language assets? What impact have government, local authority and school policies made over the last ten or so years upon patterns of:

- educational achievement for various minority communities and access to further and higher education?
- the relationships between educational qualifications and achievement, to subsequent career patterns?
- employment within the education sector?

At present, answers to such questions are difficult to establish, as there are insufficient monitoring data relating to access to education and educational achievement among minority ethnic groups, and a lack of sufficiently well-funded, detailed research and evaluation studies to demonstrate good and less good practices.

This review summarises the Scottish evidence to date, drawing, where appropriate, on comparable research from outwith Scotland. The following chapters map existing research and the issues which are starting points for an agenda for future research and development in this area and we hope researchers, practitioners and policy makers will find this a useful springboard for future action.

2 Notes on Terminology

Summary

The history of the study of 'race' issues is encapsulated in the many debates around terminology. We focus here on some of the main terms used in this review and summarise the principal reasons for particular choices.

Minority ethnic groups

Ethnic minority and *minority ethnic* are global terms to refer to all those living in the UK who do not belong to the dominant Anglo-Celtic group, conventionally the majority ethnic group. 'Minority ethnic' is now preferred to 'ethnic minority' as the latter term is held to imply that ethnicity is an attribute only of minority groups. Somewhat over-simplistically, the majority group is often regarded as including all white people, even those who do not come from the dominant Anglo-Celtic group (e.g. Italian Scots, Jews, travellers, etc), while black and Asian people are seen as the main minority ethnic groups in the UK. In this review we have used the term' minority ethnic group'.

Minority group 'labels'

The ways in which individual minority ethnic groups are defined vary widely in their comprehensiveness or specificity. For example, some writers use *black* as virtually synonymous with 'minority ethnic'; and many use *Black* (with a capital letter) to mark the political symbolism of this choice.

However, this usage, while favoured by people of African or African-Caribbean origin, has proved more controversial among those of Indian Sub-continent backgrounds, a group comprising people with links to Pakistan, India and Bangladesh. Collectively, this group is often referred to as *Asian*. The value of combining people whose backgrounds include different languages, religions, cultures and histories (including histories of immigration to the UK) is questionable, however, and it is becoming more common to use more specific labels such as *Pakistani, Indian, Bangladeshi* etc. For example, the 1991 Census used the following categories: *White, Black-Caribbean, Black-African, Black-Other, Indian, Pakistani, Bangladeshi, Chinese, Other Asian, Any Other Ethnic Group*. Although the use of these terms has also been criticised (see Chapter 3) they are used in this report on the basis that they are now commonly understood as useful categories. (Note however, that in reviewing research by others, it is usually necessary to use the terms they adopted, even if these may seem problematic.)

On occasion, commentators specify the religious or linguistic background of the group to which they refer (e.g. *Muslim* or *Punjabi-speakers*). This can be helpful or confusing, depending on the context. It has recently been argued (Singh-Raud 1997) that to focus on the religious affiliations of particular minority ethnic groups risks 'creedism' (i.e. stereotyping on the basis of

supposed religion-related traits - for example the notion that all 'Muslim' girls are destined for early marriages and that therefore their families do not value their education highly). It can similarly be confusing to use terms such as 'Punjabi speakers' which would theoretically, include both Muslim groups of Pakistani origin and Sikh groups of Indian origin, each with very different histories and different written languages.

'Labelling' people is a difficult and often controversial activity.

'Race' and racism

Issues relating to minority ethnic groups are often said to be about *race*. The word is nearly always written in inverted commas to denote that this is also a term whose meanings are complex. While there is a history of 19th and 20th century attempts at 'objective' definitions of the various 'races' of the world, it is now recognised that such definitions are political rather than scientific (as is demonstrated by the debates on 'labels' for minority ethnic groups, discussed in the previous section). Indeed, many of those who sought to define the different 'races' did so with the intention of demonstrating the intellectual inferiority of other 'races' (Grant 1992). For such reasons, and other pejorative uses (in negative combinations such as 'race riots') the use of 'race' fell out of favour for some time but has now been reclaimed as a global term, in apposition to 'gender' and 'class', particularly in the context of social justice.

Racism is classically defined as discrimination against individuals from particular racial or ethnic groups, on the basis that this group is, in some way, inferior. Such discrimination can be direct and deliberate: for example, refusing jobs to people from minority ethnic groups for no other reason than that they are not from the majority group. It can also be indirect and unthinking: for example giving British 'Christian' names to children from minority ethnic groups on the grounds that their own names are too difficult to pronounce - a practice common in the UK in the 1960s and still occasionally found in Scotland today.

In recent years there has been criticism of this type of definition of racism in that it does not allow for the existence of *institutional racism*:

> For too long racism has been thought of in individual psychological terms reducible to the actions of prejudiced individuals. The concept of institutional racism draws attention to the structural workings of institutions which exclude black people regardless of individuals' attitudes. (CRE 1985)

Thus practices which are well-intentioned, or which are perceived by those who initiate them to be neutral, can be racist if their effects on particular racial or ethnic groups are negative. For example, the CRE noted serious concerns in relation to the identification of ethnic minority pupils with special educational needs in Strathclyde. While the Region's policy on the assessment of children with special educational needs was the same for all children, the specific needs of children whose home language was not English were largely overlooked. This meant that over half of bilingual children assessed by the psychological service were assessed in English rather than in their home language; and that

frequently, their parents were not consulted because of a lack of suitably trained interpreters. Such practices might explain why minority ethnic children were over-represented in the Severe and Profound Learning Difficulties categories, and under-represented in the Moderate and Specific Learning Difficulties categories (CRE 1996). Such discrimination was not intentional, it might be argued, but it could be seen as the product of institutional racism in that the Region developed identification procedures designed to suit the majority population, and failed to take account of the effects on minority ethnic groups.

Multicultural and anti-racist education

Multicultural education aims to promote racial harmony primarily through the valuing of cultural diversity in the curriculum. Various approaches are used. For example, particularly in the 1960s and 1970s, attention was drawn to the virtually all-white populations of school text books and to the fact that where black characters did appear, they were usually stereotypical, or in an otherwise negative context. Text-book publishers are now, on the whole, more conscious of the need to reflect a range of 'ethnic groups' in illustrations and photographs. A second approach is to increase awareness of all the cultures represented within a school. It is now common for schools to celebrate Chinese New Year, as well as Christmas, and to draw attention to festivals associated with other religions, such as Eid or Baisakhi. In addition, the linguistic diversity of a school's population is often recognised by the display of posters with 'Welcome' in the languages used by children in the school.

However, although recognition and representation are important, failure to move beyond this stage can result in tokenism and in implicitly adopting an 'us and them' view of ethnic minority cultures. A truly multicultural curriculum would need to reflect the diversity of perspectives in all aspects of the curriculum: for example, showing the history of British colonialism not only from the dominant Anglo-Celtic perspective but also from those of the colonised peoples; or to consider 'great literature' or 'great art' in the context of the whole world rather than of Britain or more generally, of the western tradition. Such shifts in emphasis have been more difficult to achieve.

Multicultural approaches are criticised by those who promote anti-racist education, holding that schools need to take a more radical, more highly politicised view of the educational experiences of children from minority ethnic backgrounds. In their view, the defining feature of these children's experiences is racism (see above), and they argue that multicultural education alone will do little to change this.

> The child that is racially harassed in the playground or the child that racially harasses in the playground is not going to benefit from an understanding of 'other' cultures alone; that child requires notions of racism and racial discrimination to be tackled and to be explained.
>
> (Fraser 1992)

Anti-racism starts with recognition that racist and discriminatory behaviour are widespread throughout society and promotes strategies to combat this. Within schools or colleges, such strategies operate at various levels, including monitoring to ensure that students are achieving their potential, identifying the causes of underachievement (if any) and dealing with these, developing clear policies and procedures to deal with racist incidents and harassment, teaching explictly about racism in society and empowering students to combat discrimination wherever they encounter it.

There are currently moves in Scotland to combine both perspectives, and *multicultural and anti-racist education* -usually shortened to MCARE - policies have been developed at both school and local authority level (see Chapter 6).

Bilingualism

Bilingual refers to people who use more than one language in their daily lives. When it first came into general use to refer to children in the UK who spoke languages other than English at home but were educated in English-medium schools, there was some controversy over the appropriateness of the term. For example, could children who had only the most elementary rudiments of English be termed 'bilingual' or did the use of the term imply that at least a certain level of skill in more than one language had to be achieved before it could be used?

It is now generally accepted that children (and adults) who are expected to use more than one language in the course of their daily lives are bilingual, even although their skills in the two (or various) languages may be uneven. Indeed it is rare for bilingual adults with a high level of competence in both (or all) the languages they habitually use to be what is known as 'balanced bilinguals' - in other words to have precisely the same range of skills in both languages, and to be able to use both at the level of a monolingual speaker of any of them. Bilinguals tend to spread the range of skills they need in daily life across two or more languages, while monolinguals contain them within one language. A detailed discussion of terminology and, more generally, a wide-ranging review of research into bilingualism can be found in Hamers and Blanc (1989).

Most commentators on the education of ethnic (and linguistic) minority children prefer to describe them as 'bilingual pupils' rather than 'English as a Second Language (ESL) pupils', 'non-native speakers' or 'non-speakers' (all terms which have been used in the past, but which clearly contain biased or negative implications).

Community languages

Terms such as *first language, mother tongue* or *home language* are also controversial. The view that most children of minority ethnic origin learn a language other than English from their parents, as their first language, before encountering English, is now seen as overly simplistic. While this is usually true of children who have themselves immigrated into the UK (although even in

these cases, some may have experienced English-medium education), children of minority ethnic origin who were born in the UK often grow up in bilingual or multilingual communities in which the various languages to which they have access are used in different contexts. For example, children may learn to speak a minority language from one parent and English from the other, or they may use the minority language only with grandparents and other elderly ('first generation') relatives. They may also use this language - or, in some cases, a third language - in religious contexts. At the same time, however, they may use English with their siblings or 'code switch' between English and another language. For these reasons, the terms *community language* or *heritage language* tend to be preferred to 'mother tongue' or 'home language', although 'mother tongue teaching' is still a relatively common term in Scotland.

English as a second language

English as a Second Language (ESL) provision refers to various forms of English language support for bilingual students. This varies from special English classes exclusively for bilingual learners of English to classroom based support, where the ESL teacher helps students cope with the linguistic demands of the subjects they are studying, and - ideally - also helps the class or subject teacher to adapt their teaching approach to the needs of a multilingual classroom (see Bourne and McPake 1991). In view of the fact that many bilingual pupils speak several languages as well as English, the term 'English as a Second Language' has been criticised as inaccurate. Other terms such as *'English for Speakers of Other Languages' (ESOL)* are also used, but are not widespread.

3 Statistical Sources

Summary

- *There is a lack of accessible statistical information on which to base enquiry and conclusions.*
- *Such information as exists is patchy. Not all authorities collect statistical information on the education of people from minority ethnic groups. Statistics which are available vary between authorities both in the areas addressed and the period over which the information has been collected. There are nevertheless examples of effective data collection in Scotland.*
- *Collection by the Scottish Office of data on the ethnicity of primary and secondary pupils in Scotland was discontinued after attempts 1994-96 due to the unreliability of the data.*
- *There seem to be underlying assumptions that there are low numbers of people from minority ethnic groups living in Scotland and therefore it is not worthwhile negotiating the difficulties of collecting data.*

Problems of collecting statistics

It has proved difficult to collect data about the education of people from minority ethnic groups in Scotland partly because there are relatively small populations involved but also for reasons common across the UK:

- there are difficulties associated with definitions
- historically it has proved difficult to frame questions and to obtain high response rates related to ethnicity
- there is lack of continuity in data collected.

Imperatives to collect data were provided by the Race Relations Acts 1968 and 1976 as a result of which there was a range of attempts to establish baselines against which to measure the effects of the legislation on, for example, employment and housing of minority ethnic groups. However it proved difficult to establish appropriate terminology that would provide accurate information without being interpreted as racist. Early attempts focused on respondents' country of birth but this grew increasingly irrelevant as increasing numbers of children were born in the UK to Commonwealth immigrants. Whereas tests carried out by the Office of Population Censuses and Surveys (OPCS) had avoided using the terms 'Black and 'White', (Sillitoe and White 1992), an alternative – 'Black British' – proved unacceptable to some Asian groups although a significant proportion of Black Caribbeans were satisfied with the term. By 1989 there was little objection to the inclusion of a question on ethnicity in the 1991 census. Overall there had been some twenty years of discussion and testing to design this ethnic group question which:

> represents a series of compromises related to: the difficulty of defining 'ethnicity'; the need for simplicity because of the self-completion character of the census; the need to find workings acceptable to various minority ethnic

> groups...; and the need to produce a categorisation that could be used to monitor discrimination based on external appearance (popular ides of 'racial characteristics') as well as ethnic origin.
>
> (Karn *et al* 1997)

The categories used in the 1991 Census have been criticised for the compromises they contain. The categories were White, Black-Caribbean, Black-African, Black-Other, Indian, Pakistani, Bangladeshi, Chinese, Other Asian, Any Other Ethnic Group. Karn *et al* (1997) comments: 'The one thing that the ethnic group question does not measure is ethnicity' (p.xix) since within each group there will be mixture of distinct cultural and spatial heritages (such as 'White' will include Scottish, Irish, Greek, Turkish and other European countries). These cultures change and may be context-dependent. Nevertheless the categories are commonly understood and are probably sufficient to follow any disadvantages accruing to any broadly defined group. This report uses the 1991 Census definitions as do many other recent and current reports on minority ethnic groups.

As it was not until 1991 that a question on ethnic group was included in the census, this precludes any comparison of characteristics of UK populations with previous census data. In 1991 the total size of the minority ethnic group population was 5.5% of the total UK population. Nearly half of people in the minority ethnic groups were associated with the Indian sub-continent: Indian (840,000), Pakistani (477,000), and Bangladeshi (163,000). Black Caribbean people comprised about half a million and Chinese (nearly 157,000) made up slightly more than the Bangladeshi group.

The majority of minority ethnic groups in the UK are concentrated in England where they make up 6.2% of the population compared with 1.3% in Scotland and 1.5% in Wales. Table 1 indicates that in the 1991 census, the main minority ethnic groups in Scotland were Pakistani, Indian and Chinese.

Table 1: Population of minority ethnic groups in Great Britain and Scotland

	Total	*White*	*Black-Caribbean*	*Black-African*	*Black-Other*	*Indian*	*Pakistani*	*Bangladeshi*	*Chinese*
Gt Britain	54,888,844	51,873,794	499,964	212,362	178,401	840,255	476,555	162,835	156,938
Scotland	4,998,567	4,935,923	934	2,773	2,646	10,050	21,192	1,134	10,476

Source: 1991 Census, Ethnic Group and Country of Birth, Great Britain, Volume 2, London: OPCS, 1993, Table 6.

This data will have been overtaken by more recent immigration of groups such as Filipino and other Asians including Vietnamese and Thais. However the overall numbers remain small in Scotland.

Minorities are concentrated in large and medium-sized cities in England in a belt stretching from London in the South East to the textile towns of Lancashire in the North West (Rees and Phillips p.23). Within Scotland there are some areas with very few people indeed from minority ethnic groups; the areas with the most, but hardly substantial populations, are in urban districts –

especially Glasgow and Edinburgh. Chinese populations are more dispersed. There are no towns or cities in Great Britain in which minority ethnic groups constitute a majority.

Table 2: Ethnic group of residents from 1991 Census by 4 Scottish regions with HE institutions*

	Ethnic group - percentage									
Region/ total persons	White	Black-Caribbean	Black African	Black Other	Indian	Pakistani	Bangladeshi	Chinese	Asian	Other
Central/ 267,492	99.3	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.1	0.3	0.0	0.1	0.1	0.1
Grampian/ 503,888	99.1	0.0	0.1	0.0	0.1	0.0	0.0	0.2	0.1	0.2
Lothian/ 726,0010	98.3	0.0	0.1	0.1	0.2	0.5	0.0	0.3	0.2	0.3
Strathclyde/ 2,248,706	98.4	0.0	0.1	0.1	0.3	0.7	0.0	0.2	0.1	0.2

* Note: The Scottish local authority reorganisation in 1996 resulted in 12 regions becoming 32 Unitary Authorities.

School populations

Statistical information on the ethnicity of primary and secondary school pupils in Scotland is at best patchy. The Scottish Office collected the ethnicity, religion and home language of all P1 and S2 pupils in publicly funded schools in Scotland, but this was only done between 1994-6. Moreover, this data proved unreliable due to the large percentage of 'unknown/not known' responses and has never been published. Some local education authorities have gathered statistical information on the education of minority ethnic groups in Scotland. However the quality of this data varies from authority to authority and of course the usefulness of figures for long term trends or changes has been disrupted by government re-organisation from 12 regions into 32 unitary authorities in 1996. Some authorities, such as Aberdeen City, Dundee City, South Ayrshire and Fife, do not collect data on ethnicity and it is also clear that some authorities, by referring us to their English as a Second Language Unit, only hold information relevant to those children having difficulties with English and not to all children from minority ethnic groups.

The Education Computer Support Unit deals with the computer systems which gather statistics for the LEAs in those authorities which made up Strathclyde Region and could make use of the questionnaire developed by the Region which asks ethnic origin, religion and languages spoken in the home. The new authorities control the schools' completion of these questionnaires and in some cases, (e.g. Argyle and Bute) there are so few pupils from minority ethnic groups that they have judged it is simply not worthwhile to collect this data. For other LEAs, such as North Lanarkshire, the quality of the data is questionable.

Glasgow has been collecting statistics on primary and secondary pupils since 1989. They are classified by ethnic background, first language and other

languages spoken. It is possible to cross-reference this with a variety of other data, such as exam results and an annual report is based on this information. While most schools are likely to have few pupils from minority ethnic backgrounds, others will have substantial proportions with the highest probably being Shawlands Academy with 45% of the pupils coming from minority ethnic groups. This is an example of a school which monitors the ethnicity of pupils and uses this to analyse the composition of classes, uptake of choices and pupil performance.

Although Renfrewshire collects statistics about the number and ethnic origin of pupils within all primary, secondary and special schools, they are unable to cross-reference this data. Here pupils from minority ethnic groups make up about 2% of the total school roll.

Edinburgh collected statistics on ethnicity from around 1990 to 1995. This was largely unsuccessful, either because schools and parents were suspicious as to the reasons why this was being done, or because the forms were frequently not completed or completed incorrectly. An additional source of confusion was that at this time the Scottish Office was also asking schools to provide information on ethnicity. Edinburgh City Council are setting up a working group to re-establish collecting statistics using a similar system to that set up in Glasgow. This will not be ready before the end of 1999.

Further and higher education

The Scottish Office collects data on ethnicity for both the teaching staff and the students in FE institutions, apart from those students on very short courses and non-vocational courses. These statistics are comprehensive and detailed and include students' ethnic background. For example, Table 3 shows the number of students on vocational courses broken down by ethnic group.

Table 3: Number of students on vocational courses in FE institutions 1995-96

	Mode		Level		Sex		
	FT	*PT*	*HE*	*FE*	*Male*	*Female*	*Missing*
Total	**56,037**	**229,520**	**60,718**	**224,839**	**112,913**	**123,446**	**49,198**
White	48,215	166,634	52,168	162,681	103,555	111,294	–
Black Caribbean	36	89	51	74	62	63	–
Black African	74	221	96	199	142	153	–
Black Other	31	100	45	86	69	62	–
Indian	184	518	223	479	414	288	–
Pakistani	444	977	287	1,134	581	840	–
Bangladeshi	69	150	26	193	101	118	–
Chinese	209	711	150	770	297	623	–
Other	273	1,500	277	1,496	667	1,106	–
Unknown	6,502	58,620	7,395	57,727	7,025	8,899	49,198

Source: Scottish Office Education and Industry Department, Further Education Statistic 3

The Higher Education Statistics Agency (HESA) has collected information on ethnicity for both staff and students but the data collected in the student record

field are "not of the highest quality". All academic staff who spend at least 25% FTE time teaching are included in the return. (Data are not held on non-academic staff but some universities e.g. Edinburgh, do collect self completion data from all categories of staff.) The Student Award Agency for Scotland asks for nationality and country of birth on the application form, but this information is not stored on their dataset. They do not ask for ethnicity.

It has to be concluded that there still remains insufficient information about the people from minority ethnic groups and their experience and attainment in the various sectors of education although there is some justification for optimism from good long term records being held in the further and higher education sectors.

Emerging research issues

- What examples are there of effective statistical monitoring of pupils' educational experiences and attainment at school? How might these be extended across Scotland?
- How have the new authorities tried to meet the requirements of the Race Relations Acts 1968 and 1976 in relation to education?
- What can be learned (and not learned) from statistical analyses of educational career patterns of pupils and students from minority ethnic groups?

4 Access

Summary

- *While parents from minority ethnic groups have high educational aspirations for their children, there seems to be inadequate accessible information and career advice at all stages about their children's educational opportunities.*
- *Children from black groups tend to be over-represented in school exclusion records in England but there is no equivalent Scottish research concerned with exclusions and ethnicity.*
- *There is some evidence from Scotland to suggest there is an unmet demand for English classes among some sections of the minority ethnic population wanting to participate in post-compulsory education.*
- *In relation to minority ethnic involvement in higher education, Scottish research has identified: a lack of accessible information; problems with admissions processes, the general ethos of higher education institutions and the curriculum content; a general feeling of isolation among students from minority ethnic groups; and covert or overt forms of discrimination.*
- *Research has suggested that the higher education experiences of minority ethnic students in English higher education could not be accepted as necessarily relevant to Scotland given the nature and distribution of the Scottish minority ethnic population.*
- *Across the UK, there are higher participation rates in post-compulsory education from minority ethnic groups as a whole compared with the white population. Asians are ten times more likely to stay on than white groups. There are differences in staying on rates between different minority groups which cannot be explained only in terms of social class.*

Introduction

This section of the review looks at the available research on minority ethnic groups in relation to access in education. The chapter is divided into two sections: access and young people of school age; access and post compulsory education

In each section relevant Scottish research will be initially considered followed by research from elsewhere. In the case of research from elsewhere some comment will be made in relation to its applicability to Scotland.

Access and young people of school age

Scottish research

Whilst schooling in the UK is compulsory between the ages of 5 and 16 there are elements of educational provision which highlight issues concerning access. In Scotland several studies have focused on guidance and careers support and highlight gaps in the knowledge of minority ethnic groups concerning provision, information and available support.

The role of guidance

Evidence from a Scottish study suggests careers guidance is important. Conboy (1992) completed a study on behalf of Central Region Racial Equality Council and found that the majority of secondary pupils and recent leavers surveyed were satisfied with the career advice they had received. However the same study confirmed that 70% of parents of secondary pupils from minority groups knew nothing of details of Youth/Employment training and, in ignorance of alternative possibilities,

> push their children towards what appears to be the best option: higher education followed by a career in the professions. This may be the most appropriate path but it may be equally misguided based as it is on parental pressure largely ignorant of a system by which ethnic minority parents are so clearly being let down. (Conboy 1992 p.22)

This last finding is similar to outcomes of a study commissioned by the Department for Education and Employment (1997) in the context of the take-up of modern apprenticeships in England and Wales which suggested that the under-representation of young people from minority ethnic groups was in part due to social conditioning with traditional academic routes being seen as the principle route to qualifications. It was suggested that schools should highlight modern apprenticeship opportunities in careers education and guidance interventions to counteract stereotyping.

Education and career aspirations

There is now a body of research to show that parents from minority ethnic groups have high educational aspirations for their children and are strongly committed to supporting them and thus ensuring better access to careers than parents themselves (in some cases) had achieved, as well as social status within and outwith the minority community (Knox and Siann, 1990; Brennan and McGeever, 1990; Singh-Raud, 1990; Hampton *et al*, 1997).

Some of these studies show that minority ethnic students are more reliant than other students on their parents for advice about career choices (Knox and Siann, 1990; Hampton *et al*, 1997). However, there is also evidence that teachers and other education professionals may not be particularly well informed about ethnic minority group interests and concerns in this context, and that consequently parents may not have the information they need to help their children make appropriate decisions. For example, in Knox and Siann's study (*op. cit.*), they noted that while many more 'Muslim' girls than 'ethnic majority' girls were keen on becoming doctors, there was much less awareness among the 'Muslim' group of other health care careers.

Almeida Diniz (1996) noted that while parents from minority ethnic parents surveyed in the course of the Universities Ethos and Ethnic Minorities project were 100% in favour of their children participating in Higher Education, initiatives designed to widen access (SWAP, community education, various guidance networks) have traditionally found it hard to identify students from

ethnic minority backgrounds with an interest in higher education. He suggests that

- publicity should target ethnic minority families
- guidance services specifically geared to the needs of ethnic minority communities be developed
- access criteria be reviewed in order to ensure that issues of relevance to ethnic minority students are included (for example overseas qualifications, bilingualism, experience of surviving racial harassment)
- and appropriate support be provided.

Similar recommendations are made in research into pre-school provision in Central Region (CERES 1994) in relation to the information and support needs of parents of the school children from minority ethnic groups.

School exclusions

Much attention has recently focused on the increasing numbers of children who are being excluded from school. Although research conducted on exclusion in Scotland, (Munn *et al*, 1997) found that the ratio of boys to girls excluded was 9:1 in primary schools and 4:1 in secondary schools (p5), there has been no Scottish research which has looked at exclusions and ethnicity. Indeed the Centre for Educational Research in Ethnic Relations (CERES) in reply to the Governments recent Social Exclusion consultation paper comments:

> However, the Social Exclusion Consultation paper makes no reference at all to black/minority ethnic peoples in Scotland or gives recognition that racism and racial harassment are key causes of exclusion for Scotland's black/minority ethnic communities.
>
> (CERES 1998)

English research into school exclusions

Recent research in England, (Gillborn, 1995); Parsons, 1996) has also highlighted the issue of school exclusion. Like the Scottish study these studies draw attention to the greater number of boys being excluded. In addition there has been some research into exclusions and ethnicity. A CRE investigation in Birmingham in 1985 found that children of African-Caribbean origin were four times more likely to be excluded than their white counterparts (Karn 1997). Most permanent exclusions invove secondary age pupils and fewer girls than boys are excluded.

Moreover, as discussed elsewhere in this review, racial harassment can affect the attendance and performance of pupils from minority ethnic groups. Karn (1997) summarises the main information on exclusions:

- Quantitative material, gathered by a range of official bodies (most notably the DfEE and various LEAs) has clearly established an ethnic difference in exclusion rates.
- Black young people are proportionately more likely to be excluded than members of other ethnic groups.

- Black over-representation in exclusions is a widespread problem, affecting both primary and secondary schools.

(p52 Karn 1997)

Access and post compulsory education

Minority ethnic group involvement in further and higher education shows differing patterns of access between the various ethnic groups. While much of the research is again English or UK based there have been a few relevant Scottish studies but as with other areas of research into minority ethnic groups, studies related access in further and higher education in Scotland is characterised by patchy small scale research:

> In particular, comparative regional research or specific Scottish studies (both qualitative and quantitative) relating to higher education and ethnic minorities, is notably scarce. To date most studies are regionally based (primarily England) and tend to be restricted mainly to primary and secondary school levels, or to specific issues such as under achievement and the debate surrounding multicultural education.
>
> (Walsh *et al*, 1995, p9)

Importantly these findings suggest that the experiences of minority ethnic groups in Scotland are different from those in England although there is evidence from both Scotland and England to suggest a need for the provision of accessible English language teaching among certain sections of the minority ethnic population.

Scottish research

Among the more substantial pieces of research carried out in Scotland and funded by SHEFC are work reported by Walsh *et al* (1995) and by Hampton *et al* (1997) who aimed at establishing whether or not the lack of specific provision for minority ethnic groups in higher education acted as a deterrent. Recognising the small numbers of minority ethnic groups in Scotland the research opted for a flexible qualitative approach utilising semi-structured interviews. In relation to access procedures and acceptance criteria the research concluded:

- admissions procedures and acceptance criteria are major problems for minority ethnic groups entering higher education. Acceptance into universities varied according to ethnic origin and indeed, acceptance rates for black applicants were consistently lower than any other ethnic group in Britain.

- Contrary to the English picture, Scottish domiciled ethnic applicants (all groups except the black groups) had been fairly successful in being accepted within Universities in Strathclyde during 1994/95.

- Other barriers that were identified in terms of minority ethnic groups and access to higher education included: a lack of accessible information, the admissions process, the general ethos of higher education institutions, the curriculum content, and a general feeling of isolation, and covert or overt forms of discrimination.

(p45 Walsh)

Importantly the second phase of the research concluded that,

> although, certain fundamental issues regarding ethnic minority experiences, for example, matters relating to equal opportunities, course selection and poor job prospects, can remain consistent, on the whole the experiences documented in England could not be accepted as necessarily relevant for the Scottish student population. This view was linked to the nature and distribution of the Scottish ethnic population which is essentially different from that of the English.
>
> (p33 Hampton)

Several smaller studies focus on minority ethnic groups' disposition towards post compulsory education. A study by Corner (1987) looking at a sample of 88 ethnic and minority school leavers found the majority were keen to pursue their education on leaving school. However there was no indication of how many actually went on to further study.

Finlay (1992) looked at factors influencing the retention and progression of immigrant Asian women in programmes of adult and continuing education. This research took place in areas of high minority ethnic populations in Glasgow. In all 74 women born in the Indian sub-continent took part in the research. In each case the women had undertaken a large part of their education in their country of birth. The author concluded that the majority of women attending community based classes and those in part time college classes identified their basic need as being proficient in English.

Whilst there are a number of studies which provide insight into access in education they are often small in nature and are focused on particular issues. The field of study is extensive enough to ensure that many of these studies address different questions. Clearly further research in relation to access should seek to address this issue.

English and UK wide research

Sargant (1992) conducted a major survey into participation in education and training by adults from selected ethnic minority groups. This research focused on two main samples of 300 adults of African-Caribbean and the Indian sub-continent ethnic background with two smaller samples of 100 adults of Chinese and Black-African background. While it is claimed that the research represents the minority ethnic populations of Britain, as a whole samples were only drawn from England.

In relation to participation in education and training Sargant, found that:

- 32% of minority ethnic adults who are, or were recently, studying compared to 29% of the GB population. Within the minority ethnic group the range was from 60% of Black-Africans to 20% of Pakistanis.

More African and Chinese women were currently studying than men in the same ethnic groups. The African, Chinese and Indian groups contained high proportions of people in full-time education post-18. The proportions from Pakistan, the Caribbean and Bangladesh and GB figures were much lower.

In relation to the choice of subjects, among all minority groups this was overwhelmingly vocational with few people studying what could be described as arts or leisure subjects and the main reasons given for studying closely related to work or educational goals. Sargant concluded that the minority ethnic groups involved in the study display high levels of participation in non-compulsory education. She further identified evidence of a demand for the provision of accessible English language teaching and a need for more workplace based training opportunities

OFSTED (1996) provides further information on post compulsory education. Drawing on a survey by Drew *et al* (1997) of more than 28,000 16 year olds in 1985 and 1986 they conclude that once attainment was taken into account, ethnic origin was the single most important variable in determining the chances of staying on (p64).

Controlling for factors such as social class, gender and parental education it was found that African-Caribbeans were three times more likely to stay on in education than white young people while Asians were ten times more likely to stay on than whites. Information relating to gender differences reinforce the findings of Sargant in that more young women tend to stay on more than young men.

Modood and Shiner (1994) produced one of the few reports on minority ethnic groups' participation in higher education in UK institutions. Different minority ethnic groups displayed different take-up rates; Chinese and Black Africans tend to be over-represented in terms of applications and admissions. Others such as Bangladeshi applicants were consistently under-represented in applications and admissions. Between 1990 and 1992 the authors noted an increase in the proportion of individuals from minority ethnic groups being admitted to university. Some groups, for example, African-Caribbeans were proportionately more likely to be found in former Polytechnics than Universities. Women from minority ethnic groups were significantly less likely to have been admitted to Universities and Polytechnics than men. They concluded that some ethnic differences in the rates of admission to universities remain unexplained and pointed to the possibility that some of the differences in the rates of admission were a product of direct discrimination.

In relation to post-16 participation rates in full-time education, Drew *et al* (1997) found the same ranking as in higher education of minority ethnic groups: 82% for Chinese young people; other Asian (72%), Indian (68%) Black-African (67%) Pakistani (57%), Bangladeshi (53%) and Black-Caribbean (48%). All these minority ethnic groups were more likely than white people to be staying on at 19. These differences in participation rates could not be explained by social class: in six out of the nine minority ethnic groups, participation rates amongst 'skilled worker' households matched or exceeded those of the white professional and managerial group. The relationship between social class and staying on was, in general, weaker among minority ethnic groups than amongst white young people. (Drew *et al, opcit* p268)

Drew *et al* suggest several explanations for the higher post-16 educational participation rates for minority ethnic groups: a greater commitment to education; qualifications being seen as best passport to successful labour market entry; as a reaction to perceived 'discrimination' in the job market and a way to avoid entering that job market (and unemployment) as long as possible.

Emerging research issues

- What is the Scottish picture in relation to minority ethnic access to the range of educational services and provision? What measures are necessary to increase the information available on, and knowledge of, educational provision among minority ethnic groups?
- Why are certain minority ethnic groups substantially more likely to be found in higher education than their equivalent white counterparts?
- What steps can be taken to smooth the entry into post compulsory education for minority ethnic groups?

5 Learning and Teaching: ethos

Summary

- *Almost every agency concerned with education for schools and teachers advocates addressing issues concerned with the education of minority ethnic groups. Despite these exhortations, there has been no distinctively Scottish agenda of major research related to learning and teaching in the context of a pluralistic society.*
- *Evidence suggests that from pre-school to post-school settings, teachers' interactions with pupils can disadvantage those from minority ethnic backgrounds.*
- *A major concern for teaching is how to avoid stereotypical expectations and adapt methods of learning and teaching to the needs of all pupils including those from minority ethnic groups.*
- *There is some evidence to suggest that school ethos can endorse the view that racism is acceptable.*
- *Scotland has made significant contributions to thinking and development related to school ethos. However, racism is a largely neglected issue in research and does not provide a basis for teachers to develop anti-racist strategies.*

Commitment to multi-cultural and anti-racist education

Some regions of Scotland have long established commitments to racial equality. For example, Central (1994) and Strathclyde (1986) Regions issued both policy and guidelines for multi-cultural and anti-racist education – MCARE in the terminology used by Central Region which had recognised that race is not just a black issue.

> Although the minority ethnic population in Scotland is small and the Region has schools with no ethnic minority pupils at all, the policy is based on the belief that the issues of prejudice, discrimination and racism are matters of concern for all school and education services.
>
> (Witcher 1992, p38)

In the same spirit, the SCCC (1993; 1994) and the GTC (1994) are two of several leading bodies in Scottish education which have made clear policy statements about the rights to positive educational experiences and outcomes for pupils from minority ethnic groups. GTC identified key areas for review and development which cover not only what pupils are taught but how they are taught and the nature of the supporting environment for learning, including the training for those who teach them:

- school ethos and teacher attitude
- bilingualism and the language environment for all learners;
- home-school relationships
- the curriculum (including resources)

- teacher education and staff development
- the role of guidance

The role of guidance has been mentioned in the section of this review dealing with access but the other areas directly concerned with learning and teaching are addressed in this and following chapters.

School ethos and teacher attitude

> Schooling not only defines...what knowledge is, but also defines and regulates what a child is. (p10 Epstein 1993)

Everything that goes on in school, especially teachers' explicit and implicit messages, affects children's perception of themselves, their self esteem and what they learn. However there can be tensions between teachers' expectations based on their concepts of their *ideal pupil* and 'appropriate pupil behaviour' (Becker 1952), and the expectations of multi-cultural and anti-racist education (MCARE). Scottish primary teachers are known to favour behaviour which enables the individual pupil to function effectively as a member of a class or school. They therefore foster values which emphasise caring, consideration and respect for others, self-esteem, co-operation, good manners and work (Powney *et al* 1996).

Difficulties may arise when the teacher's ideal is not matched by appropriate behaviour by a pupil. For example, in tracking Japanese pupils in schools in England and Scotland, it was noted that primary and secondary teachers were generally favourable inclined towards these pupils and expected them to work hard and have high attainment levels (McPake and Powney 1995). Similarly Gillborn (1995) and Mac an Ghaill (1992) in England show variations in teachers' expectations of pupils from different minority groups - for example, the expectation that Asian pupils will be well disciplined and from hard working stable families where education is highly valued. In contrast, African-Caribbean boys are viewed as looking for, and expecting, trouble and tending to come from single parent families. Although these may seem like caricatures, Kaifi (1993) demonstrated the different reasons given by teachers in special schools for pupils' poor personal and skills development: for Asian pupils such poor development was apparently due to inadequate language skills whereas for white Scottish pupils, it was ascribed to immaturity and confidence levels.

Education over the last thirty years has emphasised the need for pupils to be able to demonstrate their learning orally and teachers can be discomforted by children who unable to speak English but yet demonstrate achievement in written work (McPake and Powney 1995). This is not just an issue of ethnicity. There is an absence of research which considers how teachers select from a range of teaching methods, the most appropriate for individual learners, regardless of ethnic origin.

Teachers' expectations are reflected not only in the work they present to pupils but also in their interaction with them – who is chosen to speak, to respond to a teacher's question, the teacher's reaction to pupils' contributions. Here can be unwitting demonstrations of racism: Well done Githanji, that was a good answer but shall we see if we can say it in proper English (Eggleston 1992, p47).

Work reported by Schaffer and colleagues (reported in Troyna and Edwards 1993) in eight Strathclyde multi-nursery schools staffed solely by white adults demonstrated that different patterns of adults' interaction with children from minority groups exist even in pre-school settings. In conversations with children of South Asian origin, adults tended to ask more questions largely requiring a yes/no response. In one-to-one teaching situations, staff were more directive and tended to use physical control and negative feedback with these children; in group situations, staff were more responsive to 'bids' of white Scottish children.

Expectations and stereotyping

Similarly, Wright's (1992) large scale ethnographic study in four multiracial inner city schools in England found that although the majority of staff were genuinely committed to the ideals of equality of educational opportunity, considerable discrimination in the classroom could nonetheless be identified. Asian children were largely excluded from discussions in nursery units because teachers assumed that they would have a poor command of English. Moreover, Asian girls seemed 'invisible' to teachers. Despite such attitudes and assumptions teachers still expected Asians to have some educational success. The same was not true for African-Caribbeans: teachers' educational expectations were very low, anticipating such children's behaviour to be problematic. The researchers concluded that the policies of 'we treat them all the same' reflects insensitivity to the different needs of pupils and allowed superficial, stereotypical expectations to prevail.

The outcome of stereotypical expectations is apparent in Mac an Ghaill's (1992) study of 25 African-Caribbean and Asian pupils studying A levels in a sixth form college in the Midlands. He concluded that the ways that such students perceive and respond to their educational provision varies considerably and is influenced by the ethnic group to which they belong, their gender, and the class composition of their former secondary school.

Teachers' knowledge and understanding

Stereotyping is usually based on lack of accurate information. Although there are many excellent inservice programmes and guidance materials for teachers (for example those provided by the Centre for Education for Racial Equality in Scotland - CERES), these may be used only by those who perceive there is a need for personal development in this area. It is clear that teachers are not always aware of their own ignorance and/or do not feel able to deal with the

consequences. Until a Japanese pupil became part of the sample of a research project, his teacher was unaware of the pupil's origin. (McPake and Powney 1995). Cultural identities are not static. Finn (1987) provides an example of how imprecise the term 'culture' is and that it does not convey distinct or finite boundaries. A Glasgow teacher was disappointed that her black secondary pupils responded to an assignment on 'Going to the market' by writing about Glasgow's 'Barras' rather than oriental bazaars. She felt they were uninterested in their own cultural background but as Finn points out:

> 'They are black Scots and their cultural heritage reflects this.' (p.45)

Finn's argument suggests that the ethos of the school should not be to promote an examination and tolerance of the exotic. That would be inappropriate for modern Scotland. The issues are the extent to which the ethos of the school and methods of teaching in practice meet the needs of all pupils including those from minority ethnic groups. While many of these issues are to do with language, other areas which are important are teachers' knowledge and understanding of the real culture of their pupils. The Swann report (DES, 1985) found that there were only a small number of teachers who were consciously racist but it concluded there was likely to be a good deal of unintentional racism. Both teachers themselves, and the books and other materials which they used, could support negative images of minority ethnic groups.

Racism in Scotland and in Scottish schools

While much of the research into minority ethnic groups and educational attainment has traditionally focused on the characteristics of minority ethnic groups such as social class, gender etc, increasingly researchers have begun to focus on the influence of racism and institutional barriers to attainment. This line of enquiry reflects a shift in research from a focus on the characteristics of minority ethnic groups to a more critical stance which highlights the contribution of the majority culture in general and the educational system in particular to the educational experiences and achievement of minority ethnic groups.

Scottish literature on racism and anti-racism has focused on four themes: the 'myth' of Scottish egalitarianism; racial harassment and racial discrimination; institutional racism – Scottish schools; and anti-racist initiatives.

The 'myth' of Scottish egalitarianism

The origins and the implications of the 'myth' of Scottish egalitarianism have been explored in 'mainstream' writing on Scottish education (cf. McPherson 1983).

Specifically in relation to racism in an educational context, the debate has continued since at least the late 1960s among supporters of the notion that Scotland does not suffer the same problem of racism as England (Hanley 1969; Miles and Dunlop 1987; Finn 1987; Church of Scotland 1990) and those who

argue, in contrast, that racist attitudes and their consequences are as well-developed in Scotland as anywhere else (Walsh, 1987; Arshad 1992; Fraser 1992).

Maan's history of immigration to Scotland (1992) suggests that ethnic minority groups in Scotland have a somewhat different history to those in England, and that this would account for differences in their experiences. For example, the fact that the population is proportionately smaller than in England has meant less fear of 'swamping' or of competition for jobs on the part of the majority population. There has been little socially disruptive behaviour among ethnic minority groups in Scotland and consequently a more favourable image, particularly of black people, than in England.

Opposing arguments are explored in some detail by Hawkes (1994) who concludes that the existence of the 'myth' suggests a strong desire that Scottish society should be egalitarian, and that campaigners for social justice could harness this desire as a powerful source for change, making the 'myth' reality.

Racial harassment and racial discrimination

There have been a number of policy statements on multicultural and anti-racist education which note the need to prevent racial harassment and discriminatory practices in schools and other educational organisations (EIS 1986: CRE 1991; SCCC 1993; GTC 1994 Powney *et al* 1997). Nevertheless, from the limited number of studies which have been conducted in Scotland, it appears that racial harassment and racial discrimination are widely experienced by people from minority ethnic communities, and that children are particularly badly affected by this. Racial incidents recorded by the police have increased by three and half times over the last nine years. 1997 figures showed over a thousand recorded racial incidents (see Appendix A). While it is possible that more people are increasingly likely to report incidents, it is still considered by the police and CRE that these figures underestimate the number of racial incidents occurring.

Most racial incidents, according to CRE figures, were perpetrated against people of Pakistani origin but there were reports from many other groups including people of Chinese, Indian, Mixed Race, African-Caribbean and White ethnic groups. The Regional Equality Councils of CRE note that the most common form of harassment in 1997-98 has been verbal abuse (56%) but with an increase in minor assaults over the last year and at least 16 major assaults.

At the same time, it seems clear that there is a high degree of complacency among school staff and headteachers, who believe that there is 'no problem here', and consequently fail to tackle these issues (MacBeath *et al.* 1986; Fife Regional Council, 1992; McFarland and Walsh 1995; Donald *et al.* 1995). Most of these studies are relatively limited in scope, however, and a comprehensive picture of the extent of harassment and discrimination in Scottish schools today is lacking (cf. Gilborne, 1992 where discussion of the agenda for research into race and education in Scotland is illustrated exclusively by English examples).

Institutional racism – Scottish schools

A number of commentators have argued that institutional racism is widespread in Scottish education (Fraser 1992; Arshad 1992).

Adams and Landon (1992) provide a particularly forceful critique of the *5 to 14* curriculum from this perspective. They note references to multiculturalism in several places in the Curriculum and Assessment programme, but also comment extensively on areas which have not taken into account the particular needs of ethnic minority pupils and are therefore likely to lead, indirectly, to discriminatory practice. There have been few studies into the effects of institutional racism.

Farish *et al.* (1995) looked at the implementation of equal opportunities policies for staff (from both gender and 'race' perspectives) in three case study institutions, one of which was a Scottish university. They noted that a lack of commitment to equality of opportunity in practice meant that many procedures had the potential to be discriminatory. Direct evidence of discrimination in relation to ethnic minority staff was not found, but this was in part an artefact of the very low numbers of such staff employed in the university and of the fact that no ethnic monitoring was carried out, making it difficult or impossible to identify such staff for research purposes.

Anti-racist initiatives

There are three linked approaches to the eradication of racism in education: to develop an anti-racist policy, to identify changes which need to occur in practice as a result of the policy, and to monitor and evaluate the effects of policy, in order to ensure that change does take place. The Scottish literature suggests that attention has focused on policy development, and that some consideration has been given to the changes in practice that this would entail, but that little has been done to monitor or evaluate the effects of this work.

We noted above the range of policy statements from national organisations. These are matched by many others at regional and institutional level. The development of policy is, in itself, a valuable process. Macintosh (1992) writing about the development of a school policy, acknowledges that the development phase (relatively long in this case) was instrumental in raising awareness and stimulating thought and discussion. Witcher (1992) describes how Central Region went about seeking to implement its multicultural and anti-racist education policy. The process included developing detailed guidelines on implementation, making provision for staff development and setting up review and evaluation procedures. But there are few evaluation reports available. Almeida Diniz (1996) surveyed all regional authorities (immediately prior to local government reorganisation in Scotland) and found that only one regularly monitored the effects of its multicultural/anti-racist Education policy. This is unfortunate because, as the CRE review (1997) of the effects of its investigation into special needs assessment in Strathclyde shows, 'hard data' in this context is more revealing than statements of intent.

Even official ethos indicators do not specifically consider potential racism. Certainly the indicators published by Scottish HMI (SOED 1992c; 1992d) could be applied to issues concerning pupils and staff from minority ethnic groups and matters of equity and justice relevant to all members of the school community. However examples which refer to the minority groups or address issues of racism (such as documented in Bell 1991) are largely absent from the School Development Planning Support materials (SOED 1992c; 1992d) and from discussions on school climate and ethos (e.g. SCCC 1994). Macintosh (1992) provides one of the few Scottish examples of recognising discrimination could exist in her school. She reports on experiences as a headteacher of a small inner-city community school in Edinburgh determined to bring about change in the culture of the school. Although not a research project as such, the recommendations made are the result of the self-evaluation process of the school, beginning with raising awareness:

> No change will come about if people don't think anything is wrong. And, so far as equal opportunities are concerned, a great many people are altogether too complacent, convinced that Scottish schools are pretty even-handed places where anyone who applies herself or himself will do as well as the next person. (p.65)

This recognition that racism exists in Scottish schools is not shared or given priority in all research, even the largest studies. For example minority ethnic groups are largely neglected in large scale school effectiveness studies on the grounds that they are very small minorities in Scotland and the school sample for school effectiveness research is too small to cope with all variables. However the emphasis in the Scottish school effectiveness studies is on socio-economic disadvantage, which as demonstrated in other sections of this report, is one of the factors affecting the attainment of pupils from minority ethnic groups. In looking at ethos, the most telling indicator of a strong equal opportunities culture is the action taken in response to racial (and other) discrimination and reporting back to the person concerned about what has happened (MacBeath *et al* 1996, p46).

Gillborn (1992), drawing largely on English research, also suggests that the way in which teachers respond to racist attacks and/or abuse of their pupils can endorse the view that racism is totally accepted (p30). More generally he argues for researchers to examine the question of what constitutes good practice at the school level, a question which could encourage dialogue between policy-makers, practitioners, researchers and minority ethnic communities.

Conclusion

Scotland has made significant contributions to thinking and development related to school ethos. However, racism is a largely neglected issue in research and does not provide a basis for teachers to develop anti-racist strategies.

Emerging research issues

- In addition to the need for systematic evaluation of anti-racist policy there is also a lack of research into the ethnic minority experience of education which would enable policy makers and practitioners to target inequalities more effectively. In recent years, English researchers have focused on 'the subtle range of processes, nuances and meaning that underpin minority students' experiences of schooling' (Connolly and Troyna 1998) primarily through the use of qualitative research methods, in particular ethnographic studies. Studies of this type would complement policy evaluation and help to identify issues of particular relevance to Scotland (reducing current reliance on English studies developed in a different context).
- To what extent are school staff aware of racist incidents which affect pupils? How do staff deal with racism and enable all pupils to enjoy their school and find it a safe and comfortable place to be?

6 Learning and Teaching: the curriculum

Summary

- *Issues related to the curriculum and curriculum materials are largely neglected in research focused on education of minority ethnic groups*
- *In particular, there is a lack of monitoring of the implementation of 5–14 in relation to learning and teaching of pupils from minority ethnic groups.*

The school curriculum has two responsibilities in relation to minority ethnic groups. One is to ensure that the curriculum itself is accessible to pupils from minority ethnic backgrounds, through the materials used in learning and teaching. The other is to ensure that explicit and hidden curricula are anti-racist and do not endorse prejudice and discrimination. There is an inter-dependency between these two facets:

> Without immediate anti-racist strategies, ethnic minorities will not be able to take the first steps in overcoming the obstacles created by prejudice and the long term aims of a multi-cultural curriculum will not be achievable. Without a multi-cultural curriculum to lay an improved foundation of thought for future generations, anti-racism will never have the chance of being more than crisis management
>
> (Assistant Masters and Mistresses Association 1987, p120)

Scottish curricula

The explicit curricula for Scottish education are set out in the 5–14 Programme guidelines and in the syllabi for public examinations. In 1992, CERES organised a national conference, '5–14 Development and the Elimination of Racial Discrimination within Scottish Education'. Contributors to the conference highlighted curricular and other issues likely to disadvantage pupils from minority ethnic groups. Adams and Landon (1992) provided a detailed critique of the 5–14 guidelines from the perspective of minority ethnic education. Despite these clear warnings, research on the implications of the implementation of curricula for pupils from minority ethnic groups and for anti-racism is largely absent in evaluations of 5–14 (e.g. MacBeath and Robertson 1995; Harlen 1996). It may well be that in the anxiety to cope with implementing 5–14 as well as the many other changes affecting the school sector over the last decade, anti-racist education in Scotland, as in England, has reached a standstill. A survey of local education authorities in England and Wales undertaken at the National Foundation for Educational Research for England and Wales (Taylor 1992) showed that since the 1988 Education Reform Act, these local authority advisers and inspectors shared a general perception that:

> the national and political climate was ideologically unpropitious for multi-cultural/antiracist education. This in turn, was often used locally to deny support and resourcing for the institutionalisation of multi-cultural/ antiracist education and resulted in failure to raise awareness of people's obligations to promote equality. (Taylor 1992, p5)

Taylor concludes that major factors hindering multi-cultural/antiracist developments in education are lack of finance, advisory staff and black teachers and reduced in-service budgets. As yet there is no published research relating to the impact of Scottish local government re-organisation on the education of minority ethnic groups.

There has been a longer history in England of research undertaken about the education of students from minority ethnic groups in relation to: option choices (Craft and Bardel 1984); curriculum materials (Milner 1975; Zimet 1976; Klein 1984; 1986; Hicks 1981) and access to work placements and approaches to assessment (Gill 1983). These topics have not been totally neglected in Scotland but attention and publications have largely focused since the late 1980s not on research but on multicultural and anti-racist guidelines (e.g. for example by Lothian Regional Council 1987, 1988; Mackay, P, 1989; EOC 1995a, 1995b, Powney *et al* 1997) which provide discussions of major issues, practical considerations and suggested resources as well as examples of good practice and checklists for action.

Evaluation of the use of these materials and other research on the curriculum in relation to minority ethnic groups is scarcer. CERES collates information about research carried out in Scotland relating to the issue of race and education. The last list (published April 1997) indicates a wide range of interests but contains no study related to curriculum or classroom practice. That research can yield information of practical use is demonstrated by Mirza (1997) who made a comparative study of the sexual health attitudes and needs of nearly 400 secondary pupils in Glasgow including Pakistani, Indian and White secondary school children. She concluded that the sexual health education in Glasgow was insensitive to the needs of the different groups and in particular that the Pakistani and Indian groups wanted cultural, lifestyle and religious differences to be covered in sex education classes.

Emerging research issues

- As so little research has been related to curriculum issues and the education of minority ethnic groups, the potential agenda for research in this area is immense. Certainly a review should be undertaken of the implications for pupils from minority backgrounds in the implementation of any curricula – 5–14, Standard and Higher Grade and Higher Still.
- Part of this review might deal with issues of pupils' access to subject options, work experience and extra-curricular activities at school.
- Participants in a conference organised by The Black Community Development Project, Greater Pilton in 1997 advocated the need for multi-cultural and anti-racist materials across all areas of the curriculum. Certainly schools might undertake an audit of how minority ethnic groups are portrayed (or are absent) in texts, videos and other materials used in all subjects. This could provide the basis for action in future school development planning which puts as a priority multi-cultural and anti-racist education.

7 Learning and Teaching: home and school

Summary

Mismatches between parents' and teachers' understanding of the practices of schools and schooling are likely to affect the learning of children from minority ethnic backgrounds.

- *The concerns and interests which parents from minority ethnic backgrounds are likely to have about their children's education will be, in many respects, similar to those of all parents; but there will also be other issues, specific to minority ethnic groups.*
- *There is relatively little Scottish research into the perspectives of parents from minority ethnic groups on their children's education.*

The research available suggests that:

- *Parents from minority ethnic groups have high aspirations for their children's education and career choices although information and publicity materials relating to the various education sectors rarely target minority ethnic communities specifically. Consequently these parents are not always well-informed about the options and choices available to their children.*
- *Teachers and other educational professionals are not always aware of the particular concerns and expectations of parents from minority ethnic groups.*
- *Particularly in relation to the identification of children with special educational needs, there is evidence that parental involvement in the process is hampered by lack of attention to linguistic issues and of suitable resources (such as trained interpreters).*

Home and school

The importance of good relationships between home and school is well documented. Children's learning and performance at school is determined to a substantial extent by the support they receive at home and the ways in which teachers and parents share expectations and information about the pupils concerned. The direct relevance of parents' support for their children will in part depend on their own education and understanding of the workings of the education system and of what is expected of their children as pupils. (Douglas 1964; Bernstein, 1975; Bourdieu and Passeron, 1977). Measures of parental education appear to correlate strongly with pupils school achievement. Evidence suggests:

> that parents can use their own education to help the child: general cognitive growth depends on specifically verbal interaction when a child is older than one year and so the parents linguistic skills are an important resource.
>
> (Paterson, 1992 p11)

Douglas (1964) and Plowden (1967) argued that parental interest was an important factor in educational achievement and that parental influence was greater among middle class families than working class families. Bronfenbrenner's (1973) review of US 'Headstart' initiatives found that parental involvement in interventionist programmes was crucial in preventing loss of educational gains among children who had experienced such programmes. How do these findings relate to the expectations or parents from minority ethnic backgrounds living in Scotland?

Parents' expectations

The expectations which parents from minority ethnic groups have of the education system are, in many ways, no different from those of the majority population:

> Speaking as a parent, my initial list would certainly include the following:- access to the school and all its facilities and resources, a 'good' education (whatever that phrase means), achievement (more than just academic achievement), and preparation for life with enhanced access to life chances. Most parents will also want links with the home, communication about activity, achievement, and problems, as well as the opportunity to participate.
>
> (Bakshi 1992)

However, Bakshi also notes that black parents will have addition concerns, mainly in relation to language, culture, achievement and protection. Issues relating to language, culture and protection (anti-racism) are investigated in more detail in other chapters of this review. This short chapter focuses on the available Scottish research (which is somewhat limited) into parents' expectations of their children's achievement.

As mentioned earlier in this review, parents' aspirations for their children's education and career may be high but contact with schools and teachers can be impeded by lack of information and communication and, as we shall see later, by language differences between teachers and parents from minority ethnic groups. Moreover the racism experienced by pupils from minority groups at school (Black Community Development Project 1998) could be an obstruction to pupils' learning and their parents' expectations being realised.

Communication between school and home

Professionals may not be aware of cultural differences in expectations about the relationships between home and school. McPake and Powney (forthcoming) carried out research into the experiences of Japanese children at school in Scotland, in the course of which they investigated the views of Japanese parents. They found that Japanese parents had high aspirations for their children which were accompanied by a need for very precise information about their children's progress at school. (If their children were falling behind in any aspect of school work, they expected information on how to improve matters, and were prepared to pay for additional tuition at home.) Teachers, unaccustomed to providing such detailed information or to making detailed

recommendations for ways in which parents might support their children's progress, tended to see parental requests for information as evidence of over-anxiety and therefore to play down any problems children might be experiencing.

Teachers also tended to see Japanese children's progress not in relation to class norms but rather to what might be expected of bilingual pupils. For example, an 11 year old Japanese pupil who had been at school in Scotland for 7 years but was in the lowest ability English group was described as doing well 'for an ESL pupil.' Although the findings of the research relate specifically to the Japanese community, the authors argue that it is unlikely that teachers are more familiar with the specific expectations of parents from other minority ethnic groups, and that the double standards approach ('doing well for an ESL pupil') is likely to be applied to other bilingual pupils.

Arrowsmith and Gearns (1994) profile some of the drawbacks to school-home communication in one school in Lothian with a long history of minority ethnic families living within the catchment area. Findings for this particular school included: the need for bilingual auxiliaries to help families understand school practice; the need for training for teachers in communication with children and parents from minority ethnic backgroups; and information provided in community languages does not meet the needs of parents unable to read in their own language.

Evidence produced by the Pilton Black Community Development Project (1998) also draws attention to the need for better communication between schools and parents. For example, the majority of the 57 parents from minority ethnic groups interviewed are unaware of their children's school's anti-racist policy although fear of racist incidents is a major factor for 44 of the resident 60 children from minority ethnic groups attending schools outside Greater Pilton. None of the black residents are involved in the local school's management group.

Pupils with special educational needs

There has been a particular focus on issues affecting minority ethnic children identified as having special educational needs, particularly in the former Strathclyde Region. Research carried out by the Glasgow Psychological Service (Minority Ethnic Specialist Group 1991) found that children from minority ethnic backgrounds were over-represented in the Severe and Profound Learning Difficulties categories, and under-represented in the Moderate and Specific Learning Difficulties categories, and it was suggested that, among other causes, the failure of psychologists to involve minority ethnic parents in the assessment process (for linguistic reasons) was particularly problematic. This research led to a formal investigation by the Commission for Racial Equality (CRE 1996), which raised similar points as matters of serious concern. Following the investigation, researchers from Moray House Institute of Education carried out research into the experiences of minority ethnic parents

whose children attend special schools. Preliminary findings (Almeida Diniz 1997) suggest that these parents have significant difficulty in making their views known to the school on a variety of educational and life-style issues.

Emerging research issues

- In spite of high parental aspirations among minority ethnic communities and considerable commitment to their children's education, the research suggests that professionals are unaware of the specific needs and interest of minority ethnic parents in this context and therefore fail to provide relevant information and support. Further research into their professional development needs in this area would therefore be valuable.
- Further research into parental expectations in the various minority ethnic communities about schooling would complement this work.

49

8 Learning and Teaching: language issues

Summary

While a large number of different languages are spoken by some pupils in Scotland, there is little research investigating the effects of bilingualism on learning. More attention has been paid to provision for English as a second language than opportunities for pupils to develop their skills in community languages but the effects of such services do not seem to be monitored and evaluated systematically.

- *Bilingualism has been shown to have positive effects on children's educational development. However, American research suggests that failure to develop children's skills in both languages can have detrimental effects.*
- *In the UK, bilingual education for Welsh and Gaelic speakers is well-established but has never been a serious proposition for bilingual children from ethnic minority backgrounds.*
- *Formal provision for community language teaching is made mainly in the secondary, community and adult education sectors. However, there has been very little research in Scotland into the language needs and interests of ethnic minority communities.*
- *Support for bilingual children's development of both (or all) their languages at primary level is growing, particularly in England. There appears to be little research into Scottish practice in this regard, despite a degree of commitment at national level.*
- *Greater attention at UK level has been paid to provision to support bilingual children's acquisition of English. English as a Second Language (ESL) support is less generously funded in Scotland than in England and research on the effects of such provision has been mainly on a small-scale.*

Bilingualism and education

As our 'Notes on Terminology' in Chapter Two indicate, bilingual refers to people who use more than one language in their daily lives. It is estimated that in the area covered by the former Strathclyde Region, about 48 different languages are spoken which means a large number of pupils are bilingual.

Educational benefits of bilingualism

Common sense would suggest that bilingual children might find the learning of additional languages easier than monolingual children. One piece of Scottish research bears this out. In a study of bilingual pupils' examination performance at O-Grade, Sharp and Fitzpatrick (1991) found that while French was the most difficult of 12 subjects for monolingual pupils, it came fifth out of the same 12 subjects for bilingual pupils.

It has also been established for some time that bilingual children develop certain cognitive skills earlier than monolingual children. The work of Canadian researchers Peal and Lambert (1962; see also Lambert and Tucker, 1972) found that bilingualism had a positive effect on IQ scores. Previously it had been assumed - at least by the mainly monolingual educational establishments in Canada and the USA - that bilingualism in itself, regardless of socio-economic or cultural factors, was likely to inhibit cognitive development.

Bilingual education

American research, in particular that of Cummins, has found that arresting cognitive development in children's first language (for example by moving them from the minority language culture of their home and immediate community to the majority language culture of the school and national community) has detrimental effects on cognitive development through a second language, and is a major factor in poor academic performance among bilingual pupils in American schools (Cummins 1973, 1976, 1978, 1979, 1981, 1984). As a result of Cummins' work, educational provision in minority languages for children of elementary school age in the USA is much more widespread than in Europe, with the possible exception of Scandinavia. There is, however, considerable debate about the age at which minority language education should give way to education via the medium of the majority group (i.e. English, in the case of the USA). In practice, it has been easier to provide elementary education for linguistic minority groups which are well-established and have a geographically defined presence (principally Native American and Spanish-speaking communities) than for other groups of immigrant or refugee origin who may be widely scattered across the US and do not therefore form specific and sizeable communities in any one area.

In Scotland and Wales, there are striking differences between approaches to the education of linguistic minorities regarded as indigenous (i.e. Gaelic and Welsh speakers) compared with groups of immigrant origin. The principle of Welsh-medium education at primary and secondary level (Bourne, 1989) and of Gaelic-medium education at least until the end of primary school is now well-established and supported for a wide range of educational and cultural reasons (Johnstone 1994). However, there have been few UK examples, even at a hypothetical level, of arguments for education via the medium of minority languages, even in areas where there are large populations with a shared linguistic background. In this context, it is worth noting that more pupils sat Standard Grade exams in Urdu than in Gaidhlig - i.e. Gaelic for 'native speakers' - in 1998.

One exception was the Open Door project in the early 1980s in Bradford, in which Mirpuri/ Punjabi speaking children had the opportunity to experience the first year of their primary education through the medium of Mirpuri/ Punjabi. Early findings from this project indicated that the children were likely to benefit linguistically and cognitively from education in the medium of their home

language (Fitzpatrick 1987). It has not been possible to establish whether any follow-up studies of this project have been carried out.

Support for bilingual development in primary schools

In primary schools, greater attention has been paid to the acquisition of English rather than to the development of community language skills (see below). However, recent primary practice in England is beginning to reflect greater awareness of the need to enable pupils to develop both (or all) their languages in an educational context (Gravelle 1996; Edwards 1998).

In Scotland, there appears to have been little recognition, within schools, of the potential benefits of bilingualism and of the value of supporting bilingual children's development in both (or all) languages (De Lima and Ingram 1992). However, at national level, there is some evidence of increased interest in this issue. While the Scottish Consultative Council on the Curriculum (SCCC) argued in 1988 that any kind of community language provision in schools would not be feasible (SCCC 1988), six years later, the Council issued guidelines which strongly supported that notion that bilingual children should develop their skills in both (or all) languages — although it stopped short of recommending the formal teaching of community languages (SCCC 1994). It is not clear, however, that this has led to changes in schools' views on the needs and abilities of bilingual pupils. In general, research into the language needs or interests of ethnic minority groups has been patchy.

'Community' language provision

Bilingual children seeking to acquire formal skills in their community language(s) are most likely to do so through provision made by minority ethnic communities themselves (SCCC 1988). After school or Saturday morning classes are widespread. The Linguistic Minorities Project (Linguistic Minorities Project 1985) and the National Foundation for Educational Research (NFER) (Bourne 1989) surveyed the range of minority languages spoken in England and the teaching of these languages inside and outside schools, providing valuable data on which much subsequent policy and provision has been based. There does not appear to have been a systematic exploration of the nature of community language provision in Scotland.

'Mainstream' provision for formal community language teaching tends to be restricted to secondary schools and adult or community education. English examination boards offer both GCSE and A-level in various community languages. Scottish students have, of course, been able to enter for English examinations. This year, however, for the first time Scottish pupils have been able to take Urdu as a Standard Grade subject although as yet there is not provision for different levels in the subject to attract both beginners and fluent speakers to get qualifications.

Information on the extent of adult or community provision is limited. One study (Jiwa 1994) set out to identify the adult education needs of minority

ethnic communities in Edinburgh. Although these were initially defined very widely - health issues, politics, the arts, area studies, religion (in other words much the same range as is provided for adults from the majority population) - the research revealed that the principal need which members of minority ethnic communities themselves identified was community language education. A substantial number spoke minority languages fluently but were not literate. Others wanted to learn languages which had religious significance for their communities. Many sought courses structured differently from those available, in that they were based on the needs and interests of minority ethnic communities rather than members of the majority community also interested in learning these languages. In addition, it was felt that such courses could become the focus for more wide ranging cultural and political discussion if provision was specifically aimed at minority communities. Among the implications of this study is the fact that if adults from minority ethnic communities feel that their linguistic needs are not met, the same is likely to be true for children too.

English as a second language

ESL provision in England

Traditionally, the language needs of minority ethnic groups have been seen primarily in terms of English acquisition. In order to benefit from the 'mainstream' curriculum delivered in English, bilingual pupils need to develop a high level of competence in English. Ensuring that children who speak little English at the time they start school (or join schools in the UK in the course of their educational careers) enhance their competence in English has therefore been accorded much higher priority than the development of community language skills. ESL provision has a much higher profile in England than in Scotland in part because of the larger minority ethnic population, and in part because of the availability, since the 1960s, of 'Section 11' funding from the Home Office, to support the educational needs of ethnic minority children (strictly speaking, those from the 'New Commonwealth'). 'Section 11' of the Local Government Act (Great Britain Statutes 1966) did not apply in Scotland, and consequently, funding for ESL provision has been considerably more modest.

There is a considerable literature on ESL provision in England. This ranges from policy statements, in particular the 'Bullock' (DES 1975) and 'Swann' reports (DES 1985), to debates over the nature of provision and the educational and political implications of adopting particular models (cf. Meek's 1996 collection of writings by Josie Levine, which charts the history of these developments).

ESL provision in Scotland

In Scotland, too, the predominant response to the languages needs of ethnic minority pupils has been seeking to provide ESL support. However, with more limited funding and a smaller and more dispersed ethnic minority population, a

major issue has been the adequacy of specialist provision. Ingram's study (1991) of such provision in one school with a relatively high proportion of bilingual pupils showed that the ESL specialist was able to provide support for under 50% of the group, and that there was evidence that pupils who were not supported were under-achieving. Perhaps because of the recognition of the limits of what specialist services can achieve, there has been particular criticism of the notion in the *English Language 5–14* guidelines, which imply it is the ESL teacher rather than the class teacher who has responsibility for the development of bilingual pupils' competence in English, failing to mention the need to base support in the mainstream curriculum and to develop a whole-school approach to such provision (Adams and Landon 1992).

Outwith the compulsory sector there has similarly been little attention to the English language needs of minority ethnic groups in Scotland. One Scottish study explored English provision for bilingual FE students, with a view to developing an appropriate model for Scottish FE colleges (Thorpe *et al.* 1992). It is of note that interest in such provision in FE colleges has coincided with an increase in admissions of overseas students bringing substantial financial benefits. The question is whether provision for Scottish ethnic minority students should be linked to that provided for foreign students.

Language, culture and access to resources

Language issues affect aspects of a child's life outwith school. For example, Chakrabati and Cadmans study of Social Work Services and Black People in a Glasgow neighbourhood (quoted in 1994 Ridley and Kendrick, eds.) adds further evidence to the claim, that minority ethnic groups experience additional barriers to achievement compared with majority ethnic groups:

> In relation to knowledge of services they found black people, even some who have been resident for a couple of decades, knew very little about the kind of services which were available.
>
> (p8 Ridley and Kendrick , eds. 1994)

Similarly, Bowes and Domokos (1991) demonstrated difficulties that minority ethnic groups in Scotland may have in relation to accessing health services. Many problems were related to communication problems with their GP and this may have direct effects on children from minority ethnic groups.

The Social Policy Research Unit (1994) at Leeds University has drawn attention to the fact that minority ethnic group perceptions of welfare benefits are generally negative. Often they were influenced by religious and cultural factors which effectively prevented some from claiming benefits that they were entitled to. In particular they found that Bangladeshi, Pakistani and Chinese communities felt that their was a degree of stigma attached to claiming and some even experienced direct hostility from their families.

Emerging research issues

- Pupils who regularly use more than one language are demonstrating considerable linguistic skills. It would be helpful to have more understanding of the positive effects as well as the disadvantages of bilingualism on learning at school and in further and higher education.
- Lack of research into the linguistic needs and interests of the various ethnic minority groups in Scotland makes it difficult to establish appropriate provision to support the development of community languages. A national picture of 'the other languages of Scotland', including patterns of use, provision of teaching and an account of needs and interests not currently met, would be of immense value in this context.
- While ESL provision is well-established in areas of Scotland where there are sufficient numbers of bilingual children to warrant it, there is no clear account of the current nature of provision or of its impact on bilingual pupils. Research into these issues is also needed.

9 Learning and Teaching: teacher education and staff development

Summary

- *Racism or discrimination has been evident in work experience for pupils and teaching placements for trainee teachers from minority groups in England. As yet attention has not been paid to this in Scottish research.*
- *English research suggests that teaching training programmes have been slow to respond to the changing populations and needs of schools and that action is required in relation to minority ethnic groups and anti-racism in the following areas: admissions policy, administrative structures, school liaison, course content and staffing policy.*
- *There seems an absence of research in Scotland reviewing any of these areas and of the long term effects of initial and inservice multi-cultural and anti-racist programmes on teachers' subsequent practice and their pupils' learning.*

The quality of the teaching force is likely to be the major factor in providing a good education for all pupils. In relation to the education of minority ethnic groups, both the composition of the teaching force and the way teachers promote multi-cultural and anti-racist education are vital. Research areas relevant to teacher education are low recruitment into the profession from minority ethnic groups as well as the content, access, and experiences of programmes of initial and inservice training. There is little Scottish research published in any of these areas.

Recruitment

At present, the Educational Institute for Scotland (EIS), the largest union for teachers in Scotland, has approximately 50,000 members of whom 201 identify themselves as being from minority ethnic groups. These figures may slightly under-estimate the numbers of teachers with minority ethnic backgrounds as there remains some reluctance among respondents in identifying themselves as such and there are no monitoring data available from other unions or the GTC. Nevertheless, it is clear that teaching is not attracting trainees from minority ethnic groups.

One attempt to ameliorate the situation is through an ongoing action-research project co-ordinated by Andrew Johnson at Strathclyde University and funded by SHEFC which is designed to enhance the recruitment rates of black and minority ethnic staff and students into teaching, social work and community education. A key part of the project is to build an ethos within Consortium institutions (Strathclyde University, Moray House Institute of Education and the University of Glasgow) that will support minority ethnic students not only at point of access to higher education but throughout their course of study and towards their careers. A mentoring scheme has monitored the support needs of these students in the institutions. The project might be described as an action research project since the need and direction of action is supported by

research evidence collected through qualitative methods and audit involving some 200 staff as well as students from black/minority ethnic groups.

As part of the study, the project workers identified a clear gap between institutional provision and ethnic minority aspirations. In-depth discussions conducted with a range of staff have indicated a demand for general and specific staff development including guidance in fair interviewing and course specific development strategies for linking with minority ethnic communities. Discrepancies emerged between how staff and students rated the institutions' effectiveness in dealing with racism :

> It is not insignificant that qualitative data tends to indicate a black/ethnic minority perspective that suggests the need for institutions (training and employing) to 'get their house in order' with regard to clear effective and publicised antiracist practices and procedures before many black/ethnic minority potential students will contemplate accessing them.
>
> Johnson (personal communication)

The kinds of criticisms made by students are that even where anti-racist policies exist, they are not visible, are not always seen to be implemented and leave black students in need of support in the face of racism from some colleagues, pupils and parents. This failure to fully and actively promote existing policies tended to make black students themselves 'invisible' and the institution avoided dealing with the reality of their lives by treating all students the same. Even the promotional literature for courses ignores black people as potential students.

Initial teacher education

All teacher education programmes require school placements and these can be surprisingly negative experiences for trainee students and qualified teachers of black and other minority descent (Jones *et al* 1996, Blair and Maylor 1993). Some black trainees report good rapport with pupils and with their mentors and using their ethnic background to the advantage of pupils in the school (Jones *et al* 1996). However these studies also document examples of how black trainee students and teachers working in schools in England are in a more vulnerable position than white students in having to deal with racism from some pupils, teaching colleagues and (in the case of student teachers, sometimes even their mentors). Blair and Maylor also reveal some white teachers' levels of ignorance – such as assuming that there are common languages and cultures among minority ethnic groups. Going beyond this one might question the role of different expectations and views on the purposes of education and the forms it might take among various ethnic and socio-economic groups.

Initial teacher training institutions have some responsibility here. In a UK wide survey of black initial training students, sources of racism were identified not only during teaching practice but also from fellow students, in courses, from lecturers, in administration, in resources and accommodation (Siraj-Blatchford 1991). Yet as the Swann Report (1985) affirms white as well as black children

need to be offered positive black role models. Iram Siraj-Blatchford (1993) quotes a CRE survey of 1988 which revealed that where black teachers were employed, they were generally on lower than average salaries, tended to be in shortage subjects and on average older than their white colleagues at the same level.

Teacher training institutions in Scotland are required in their initial programmes to prepare teachers to 'identify and provide for the range of pupils including those.....with diverse social and cultural backgrounds' (SOEID, 1993). Competences required of newly qualified teachers include being able to 'take into account cultural differences among pupils' and, within competences related to Professionalism, having 'a commitment to views of fairness and equality of opportunity as expressed in multi-cultural and other non-discriminatory policies'. As yet there has been no evaluation of how these competences are sustained by experienced teachers.

Arora (1986) considered that teaching training programmes had been slow to respond to the changing populations and needs of schools. She documents changes made in Bradford and Ilkley Community College over the ten year period to 1985 identifying five areas required for action in relation to minority ethnic groups and anti-racism: admissions policy, administrative structure, school liaison, course content and staffing policy. There seems an absence of research in Scotland reviewing any of these areas and of the long term effects of initial and inservice multi-cultural and anti-racist programmes on teaching and learning.

Staff development

If multi-cultural and anti-racist education is going to be meaningful, inservice programmes will need to address the issues raised in Chapter Five on ethos where it is apparent that many teachers are fairly ignorant about the different minority ethnic groups living in Scotland and about how to cope with racism in schools. That is one aspect of staff development.

Another issue pertinent to education and minority ethnic groups is the kind of career opportunities for teachers from minority ethnic backgrounds. What are the career profiles of these teachers? Are they found in particular subjects or sectors of schooling? What is the distribution of teachers from minority groups in terms of age, gender, promoted posts, subjects and sectors of schooling?

Emerging research issues

- What are the effects of initial and inservice multi-cultural and anti-racist programmes for teachers on their subsequent teaching and their students' learning?
- How can schools and teacher training institutions provide better support for pupils and students from minority ethnic groups on work experience and school placements?

- There is low recruitment of students and teachers from minority ethnic groups. Research into the career profiles of these students and teachers could illuminate the perceived obstacles to their entry and advancement in the profession and factors that could enhance their careers. What is the distribution of teachers from minority groups in terms of age, gender, promoted posts, subjects and sectors of schooling?

10 Attainment

Summary

School attainment

- *The Scottish research contribution to the debate on school attainment appears to be at best fairly minimal reflecting individual interest in particular themes rather than being systematic and cumulative development of a body of research related to the educational attainment of minority ethnic groups.*
- *Much of the relevant research has taken place outwith Scotland. Empirical research carried out in Scotland often 'fails' to achieve sufficiently large samples to deal with the number of variables involved in looking at ethnicity and attainment.*
- *Insufficient research has been carried out in Scotland to make definitive statements about the relationship between ethnicity and school attainment. There is a need for increased monitoring of achievement by ethnic grouping at school.*
- *Outwith Scotland concern has been raised about the under-achievement of African-Caribbeans, particularly males, and some South Asian groups in school. Indeed there is evidence to suggest a widening of the gap between those ethnic groups who were succeeding and those who were doing less well academically over the last few years.*

Attainment in further and higher education

- *Until recently figures for ethnicity have not been published centrally making research into attainment in Scottish higher education particularly difficult. Some research suggests that some HEIs have been less than willing to cooperate with such studies.*
- *Little research has been conducted in Scotland on attainment in further and higher education. On a UK basis Chinese, Black-Africans and Other-Asians are overall the groups most likely, and the Pakistani, Bangladeshi and Black-Caribbeans least likely, to hold a higher education qualification.*

Factors influencing patterns of attainment

- *Minority ethnic populations in Scotland are more likely than their white counterparts to experience social and environmental situations which correlate with low attainment.*
- *Scottish research into explaining patterns of educational attainment by ethnicity has focused on the influence of factors such as unemployment, poverty, and poor housing. Most of the major empirical studies indicating the correlation between social class and differential educational achievement have either taken place in England or on a UK wide basis.*
- *Generally, research into the links between social class, ethnicity and educational achievement are less well developed than research into social class and attainment.*

Introduction

This section of the review looks at the available research on minority ethnic groups in relation to attainment and the social/environmental factors which may impinge on this. The chapter is divided into three sections: School attainment, Attainment in further and higher education, Factors influencing patterns of attainment

In each section relevant Scottish research will be initially considered followed by research from elsewhere, with comment being made in relation to its applicability to Scotland.

Whilst the research presented here highlights differences in achievement between ethnic groups, it is important to bear in mind that there are many complex issues around the concepts of achievement and under-achievement. There is a danger that simple messages of minority ethnic group under-achievement will merely add to the barriers that such groups may face in the educational system. As Gillborn points out,

> Many people lost sight of the fact that talk of under-achievement related to group *averages* and, therefore, held no predictive power in individual cases.
> (1992 p26)

School attainment

Scottish research

The Scottish research contribution to the debate on school attainment appears to be at best fairly minimal reflecting individual interest in particular themes rather than being systematic and cumulative development of a body of research related to the educational attainment of minority ethnic groups. Much of the important research on attainment of people from minority ethnic groups minorities has taken place outwith Scotland. England in particular has a substantially larger body of evidence in relation to minority ethnic research.

The recent studies discussed here highlight one of the major difficulties associated with conducting research into minority ethnic groups in Scotland: generating a sufficiently large enough sample to allow for robust exploration of variables beyond those involved in establishing basic correlations between ethnicity and performance. Indeed Kennedy (1996) shows that even with a relatively large sample, almost of 700 pupils, the number of variables involved are sufficiently great to make detailed analysis impossible. Whilst the Scottish research may be of limited use it does raise important questions about the efficacy of methodologies which attempt to explore issues involving a large numbers of variables with relatively small samples.

The Scottish Examinations Board (1991) conducted research into the attainment of *Ethnic minority candidates in examinations in English*. This study investigated the extent to which pupils whose home language is not English under-perform in examinations in English at age 16, relative to performance in other subjects. Based on a sample of 208 pupils presented for Ordinary and

Standard Grade examinations the research suggested that at Ordinary Grade English, pupils from minority ethnic backgrounds perform approximately half a grade lower than would have been predicted based on performance in other subjects. However, at Standard Grade, pupils presented for English and at least one of Mathematics and Science do better at English, approximately half a grade better than would have been expected on the basis of performance on other subject examinations. While this may indicate that Standard Grade English presents better opportunities than its Ordinary grade counterpart for ESL pupils to demonstrate attainment within an examination format, the research also noted the small sample of pupils involved (31) and concluded that further research would be required to investigate this.

Indeed, while the sample of over 200 candidates represents the largest group to have been identified for investigation into this aspect of examination performance, the researchers noted that the nature of the sample made it impossible to investigate the effects of independent variables. In particular the research highlighted the need for further investigation of candidates of Chinese descent who may have deep rooted and marked difficulties with the English language.

Kennedy (1996) conducted a survey of 696 pupils in four Glasgow secondary schools aiming to confirm whether there was any relationship between ethnicity and attainment in external examinations. He considered Standard Grade examination results, seeking to determine if attainment was in any way influenced by independent variables such as gender, attendance, socio-economic status and choice of school. While concluding that there appeared to be no correlation between performance in public examinations and ethnicity, in a number of core subjects, English, Chemistry and French, there was evidence of white pupil under-achievement. While the sample was relatively large the number of variables under investigation and the subsequent 'cell size', 'obscured much of the information which might otherwise have been thus derived.' (Kennedy 1996 p94)

English research

Much of the English research highlights the relative under-achievement of African-Caribbean males and Bangladeshi groups in comparison to other minority ethnic and majority ethnic groups. Pupils of Indian origin generally perform better in school than children from other ethnic groups.

The Government sponsored Rampton (1981), Swann Committee (1985), and more recently OFSTED (1996) reports have highlighted the fact that some ethnic groupings do less well at school than their white peers. In the case of the Swann report a survey of five LEAs found that Asians generally did almost as well as the 'whites', although it was noted that one particular Asian group - those of Bangladeshi origin - did particularly poorly. The performance of African-Caribbeans was also considerably poorer on average than that of the 'white' population with only 5% of African-Caribbean pupils passing a single 'A'

level and only 1% going on to university. The 1996 OFSTED report concurs with much of the earlier material, in relation to school achievement. However the data contained in the report unlike the others draws on a nationally (English) representative sample. Findings from the early years include:

- Both ethnic background and language fluency had a statistically significant impact upon reading progress; pupils of Caribbean backgrounds and those of Asian origin made significantly poorer progress than other groups. (p11)

However at later stages the Asian pupils shared improvements:

- On average African-Caribbean pupils (of both sexes) achieved below the level attained by the other groups. (p17)

Other findings from later school stages include:

- Indian pupils appear consistently to achieve more highly, on average, than pupils from other South Asian backgrounds and achieve higher rates of success than their white counterparts in some (but not all) urban areas.
- There is no single pattern of achievement for Pakistani pupils, although they achieve less well than whites in many areas.
- African-Caribbean pupils have not shared equally in the increasing rates of educational achievement: in many LEAs their average achievements are significantly lower than other groups with the under-achievement of many African-Caribbean young men a particular cause for concern.

An article in the Independent newspaper highlights the plight of African-Caribbean boys.

> They averaged only one third of the male scores in technical subjects. In Birmingham one of the few LEAs which monitors ethnic minority performance 8.6% (of African Caribbean boys) achieved the top three grades in 1995 Maths GCSE and 12.4% in science compared to 34 2% and 44.1% of Indian boys and 32.2% and 36.9% of white boys respectively. (M. Brooks, The Independent Thursday 4th December 1997).

Whilst there are a number of large scale surveys which report on school based achievement, only a few are nationally representative and in many cases nationally representative means reflecting the English experience. We would concur with Gillborn (1992 p27) in that there are still very few certainties despite the great deal of published statistical work.

In general it appears that certain South Asian groups, African-Caribbeans and in particular, African-Caribbean boys, are more likely than their peers to under-achieve at school. As highlighted elsewhere in this review, African-Caribbean pupils are also the group most at risk of exclusion from school.

Whilst the English research raises particular concerns over the performance of children of African-Caribbean origin, its relevance to Scotland is likely to be fairly limited. While many English cities have sizeable populations of people of African-Caribbean origin, the same cannot be said of Scotland where, for example, Glasgow with a population of over six hundred thousand has just over 200 African-Caribbeans (1991 census). Moreover, given that

unemployment rates for Black-African men in Glasgow are lower than that of white males in the city (19% of African-Caribbean males compared to 23% of white males are unemployed) and that educational attainment is at least in part related to socio-economic position, then the English research findings on attainment may not be entirely relevant.

Changes in achievement between ethnic groups

One important finding highlighted by OFSTED (1996) concerns the relative improvements made by pupils from different ethnic backgrounds over time. While they point out that pupils from many different ethnic backgrounds have achieved improved performances - no groups have been universally exempted - they go on to state:

> The gap has widened between the most successful and least successful groups. In general the LEA returns indicate that greater improvements in GCSE results have been made by the ethnic groups that already faired best locally.
>
> (p23)

This finding highlights the need for monitoring of performance by ethnic grouping. While LEAs are empowered to conduct such exercises and are encouraged to do so by OFSTED, 'Recent inspections report clear evidence of good ethnic monitoring in less than one school in every two hundred inspected' (p79).

Gillborn also raises this point about the need for ethnic monitoring,

> At the national, local and school level we need to know more about differences in the experiences and achievements of ethnic minority students. It is necessary to gather relevant material in ways which are sensitive to the concerns of ethnic groups and communities (including white students and parents) and sophisticated enough to answer pertinent questions.
>
> (Gillborn 1992 p35)

Such developments are clearly important in relation to improving standards in schools. However, in Scotland, the recent local government reorganisation may, at least in the short term, reduce the likelihood of such procedures being implemented since new authorities are smaller with fewer resources available.

Achievement in further and higher education

Scottish research

Research into attainment in further and higher education in Scotland among minority ethnic groups is similar in character to school attainment research, generally patchy and small scale in nature.

> In particular, comparative regional research or specific Scottish studies (both qualitative and quantitative) relating to higher education and ethnic minorities, is notably scarce. To date most studies are regionally based (primarily England) and tend to be restricted mainly to primary and secondary school levels, or to specific issues such as under-achievement and the debate surrounding multicultural education.
>
> (Walsh *et al*, 1995 p9)

Moreover, since figures for ethnicity have only recently begun to be published centrally the difficulty of establishing a comprehensive picture of access and/or attainment in Scottish further and higher education is compounded. Indeed Hampton *et al* (1995) noted that few HEIs in Scotland were willing to provide information on ethnicity or even discuss the issue.

UK wide research

Ethnic minority involvement in further and higher education shows, as with research into school achievement, different ethnic groupings having different patterns of achievement. In relation to the UK as a whole, Chinese, Black-Africans and Other-Asians are most likely to hold a higher qualification.

Drawing on the 1991 census material, Owen (1994) and Blackburn *et al* (1997) explored the extent to which men and women from different ethnic groups achieve higher educational qualifications (Postgraduate, first degree, above A-level and equivalent) and Blackburn *et al* (1997) extended this to see how well these qualifications provide access to desirable occupations. Both analyses found that the men (except in the Black-Caribbean group) were more likely to have degrees than women although women were slightly more likely to have a higher level qualification below degree level, for example, nursing (p.245). There were also clear differences between minority ethnic groups. The Chinese, Black-Africans and Other-Asians were consistently the groups most likely, and the Pakistani, Bangladeshi and Black-Caribbeans least likely, to hold a higher qualification. A most interesting exception is degree level qualifications where the order is almost the same with Indians being a little higher but where almost all the Bangladeshi men with a higher qualification had degrees - i.e. proportionally more degrees than the percentage of white people with degrees among the UK-born men.

Factors influencing patterns of attainment

Research in education has often focused on explanations of why some groups tend to reach higher levels of educational attainment than others. Attention has been directed particularly towards differences in school achievement between social classes. Research has shown that the higher the social class, the higher the levels of educational achievement are likely to be. The children of parents in higher social classes are more likely to stay on in post compulsory education, more likely to achieve examination passes when at school, and more likely to gain university entrance. If class is an important variable in explaining differential educational outcomes, to what extent might it explain variation in educational outcomes of different ethnic groupings? As discussed below much research indicates that the relationship between educational achievement and social class is greater than the relationship between ethnicity and educational achievement.

It can be argued that research into class and educational achievement in England is relevant to Scotland since the experiences of, for example, the industrial

working classes in both countries is more similar than different. However, it has also been established (McCrone 1994, Paterson 1992) that the Scottish education system has, at least in part, a more egalitarian tradition than that in England. Thus it is quite possible that social class and attainment patterns among minority ethnic populations in Scotland may not directly mirror those of England.

Scottish research

Scottish research in this area has focused on highlighting individual factors which are likely to impinge on educational attainment and aspirations. Research has tended to explore single issues — such as, poverty, housing, and health — which although they generally correlate with social class do not give a systematic insight into the educational contributions of the range of variables associated with social class and ethnicity. Most of the major empirical studies exploring the relationships between social class and differential educational achievement have either taken place in England or on a UK wide basis.

Findings from the Scottish Young People's Survey consistently highlight the relationship between parental occupation and children's attainment at school (Lynn 1995). Clearly, increased levels of income allow children to be better resourced at school and at home. Relative poverty then becomes an important factor:

> Inadequate housing, for example, leads to overcrowding and hence difficulties for a pupil wanting to work at home. Poor conditions for parents in their jobs can lead to stress and ill health, which can then induce similar ailments in their children.
>
> (Paterson 1992 p10)

Using data from the Scottish Young Peoples Survey, Garner and Raudenbush (1991) highlighted the significant effects of neighbourhood on young people's educational performance, arguing that those from the most deprived home neighbourhoods performed less well than children from similar home backgrounds living in more advantaged home neighbourhoods.

Clearly housing and local environments can impact on the educational and life chances of people. Importantly, Hampton and Bain's (1995) literature review of ethnicity and poverty among minority ethnic groups in Scotland highlights the living conditions of some minority ethnic groups. Although higher proportions of minority ethnic groups are owner-occupiers of houses, these are often in areas of poorer quality housing. Indeed they also suggest that overcrowding is a problem for many minority ethnic households especially in Glasgow.

Whilst Hampton and Bain make the general point that much of the research in this area ignores Scotland, 'especially failing to take into account the particular composition and patterns of settlement of its minority ethnic groups' (p9), they go on to summarise the available relevant pieces of research in relation to poverty among minority ethnic groups in Scotland. In relation to employment, a major component of social class, they point out that male minority ethnic

employment is higher than their white counterparts and that the self-employment patterns of many Asian and Chinese groups do not necessarily indicate affluence. Moreover, many members of minority ethnic groups support extended family networks on their income and may be under-claiming on welfare benefits and are thus more susceptible to poverty and deprivation. In relation to health patterns Hampton and Bain also noted that peri-natal mortality rates among minority ethnic women are higher than among other groups.

Chaudhry (1996) also looks at issues around poverty and race although this time within the former Strathclyde Region. Highlighting many of the studies and issues raised by Hampton and Bain, she points out that little work has been carried out in Scotland to develop a comprehensive understanding of how poverty impacts on, and is experienced by, black and minority ethnic groups. Quoting Pacione (1989),

> In Scotland, the complex of poverty related problems such as poor housing, increased rates of family breakdown, increased mortality, homelessness and mental illness have shown to exhibit a spatial concentration in particular parts of the inner city areas where most ethnic minorities tend to reside.
>
> (Chaudhry 1989 p32)

The available evidence would suggest that some minority ethnic populations in Scotland are more likely than their white counterparts to experience social and environmental situations which correlate with lower educational attainment. Indeed it is quite likely that some minority ethnic families will be experiencing the cumulative effects of several factors, for example, being unemployed living in overcrowded accommodation and having to support extended family members. Such situations are likely to reduce the effectiveness of the family to provide educational support for children or allow the pursuit of further study beyond compulsory education.

English and UK wide based research

Social class and educational attainment

The findings in the relationship between social class and attainment are marked in their consistency:

> All the surveys admit that educational achievement is directly related to socio-economic position. (p285 Coultas 1989)

Halsey *et al* (1980) studied over 8000 males born between 1913 and 1952 and found that a boy from the middle class sector, compared to one from the working class had four times as great a chance of being at school at 16, eight times the chance at 17, and ten times the chance at 18. Moreover, they had an eleven times greater chance of going to university. Figures from the General Household Survey 1990-91 reveal that 51 per cent of the children of professional fathers had a degree or other higher education qualification compared to just 8% of the children of fathers with unskilled manual jobs. Sixty

per cent of the children of men with unskilled manual jobs had no qualifications compared to 7 per cent of the children of professional fathers.

Social class, ethnicity and attainment

Whilst it has been demonstrated by many sources over a substantial period that social class and educational attainment are strongly correlated, the links between ethnicity, social class and attainment are less well established. It has been argued that poorer educational performance on the part of minority ethnic groups may in part be due to their class position. The Swann Committee (1985) investigated this issue and concluded that poor educational performance by minority ethnic groups was at least in part the result of their social class rather than their ethnicity. The OFSTED report (1996) confirms these findings. In this case, results were based on a nationally (English) representative sample.

> Social class is strongly associated with achievement regardless of gender and ethnic background: whatever the pupils gender or ethnic origin, those from the higher social class backgrounds do better on average.
>
> (OFSTED p17)

Jones (1993) analysis of the Labour Force Survey provides further support for this conclusion. He found that class makes a significant difference to the likelihood of ethnic minority children staying on in education after 16: only 47 per cent of ethnic minority children aged 16-19 from unskilled or semi-skilled backgrounds were in full-time education compared to 69 per cent of those from a professional managerial or employer background. The high concentration of minority ethnic groups in low social classes could therefore affect their generally lower staying on rate. This point is echoed by Coultas (1989), 'Children of West Indian family origin are concentrated in the lowest two social classes as defined by the Registrar General' (p285).

From the 1991 census Heath and McMahon (1997) describe the following picture of ethnic grouping and social class in relation to first generation men:

> The most 'successful' groups were the Chinese and Other-Asian groups, who were the most likely to be found in the managerial and professional jobs of the salariat. Next came the Black-Africans and Indians, followed by the Irish-born Whites and the Black-Others, while Black-Caribbeans, Pakistanis and Bangladeshis lagged substantially behind in access to the salariat.
>
> (p94)

While the previous sources suggest that the social class position of minority ethnic groups as with the majority ethnic group is likely to influence educational achievement in particular, and life chances in general, the Heath and McMahon study may additionally provide evidence of discrimination at point of entry to work.

Emerging research issues

- What is the Scottish picture in relation to attainment in education of different ethnic groups.

- What contributions do the range of social, cultural and economic factors make to educational attainment?
- What monitoring and recording procedures need to be established to support independent Scottish research? Can a common set of criteria be arrived at to accomplish this at institutional, local authority and national levels and across different departments?

11 Ethnicity and educational employment

Summary

There is considerable scope for extending monitoring information concerning recruitment and levels of appointment of minority ethnic staff in all sectors of education.

- *Most advertisements for staff mention that employers have an equal opportunities policy yet there is little subsequent research related to ethnicity and equal opportunities in relation to staff educational appointments and promotion in Scotland.*
- *Statistics associating ethnicity and educational employment in Scotland are 'virtually invisible'.*
- *General employment statistics in various education sectors show that black workers are under-represented compared to their share of the population in both male and female dominated services. Further, where black workers are employed, they often remained at the lowest grades.*
- *It appears that equal opportunities legislation has had little impact as yet on the employment patterns of staff from minority ethnic groups employed in education in Scotland.*
- *There are few studies which explore issues of multiple discrimination in relation to educational appointments.*

Further and higher education

> We recommend that all institutions should, as part of their human resources policy, maintain equal opportunities policies, and, over the medium term, should identify and remove barriers which inhibit recruitment and progression for particular groups and monitor and publish their progress towards greater equality of opportunity for all groups.
>
> (Recommendation 49 Dearing Report)

This recommendation from the Dearing report recognises the inequities operating in higher education and which result (*inter alia*) in the difficulties of black and minority ethnic staff following academic careers in the UK. The current picture is near absence of staff from minority ethnic groups in higher education, partly as a consequence of differing relative educational capital and expectations and partly as the changing concepts of career. Little is known about the status and progression of staff from minority ethnic groups at all levels in the UK as until HESA records were developed there has been no standardised ethnic monitoring of recruitment and progression. It is also notoriously difficult to collect data through ethnic monitoring; not surprisingly there is a wide-spread reluctance on the part of black and minority ethnic people to fill in ethnic monitoring forms (CRE 1991; 1992). There is a genuine apprehension that such personal and private information may be used counter-

productively and it is likely that any figures that are available are most likely to underestimate the total numbers of minority ethnic staff in higher education.

Staff from minority ethnic groups are under-represented in higher education posts. AUT evidence to the National Committee of Inquiry into Higher Education shows that while the White population is 94.3 per cent of the GB population, 96.5 per cent of higher education staff are White. (Sources HESA and Social Trends 1996). Data available from sources such as NATFHE, one of the largest unions representing lecturers in the UK's 169 higher educational establishments, show that out of 75,000 members as few as 11 were African-Caribbean, 52 Asian, 7 African, with 19 categorised as 'other Black' (Mirza 1995). This gives a ratio of approximately 1:1000 of Black and minority ethnic groups in academic positions. Similarly a survey of senior UK academic staff by CUCO revealed that while 97 per cent (2,403) of senior positions were held by white staff only 1 per cent (35) came from minority ethnic groups. The survey revealed that only 2 Black women held senior positions in the UK (CUCO 1997). As can be seen in Appendix B few staff from minority groups reach the level of professor; the first black woman professor in Britain was appointed to Middlesex University in 1998.

What is clearly evident from these studies is that black and minority ethnic staff (both overseas and home) remain visibly absent from junior and senior positions in academic and technical and related occupations in the majority of new and old universities. Where black staff are found they are concentrated in 'academic niches' such as certain subject areas like computing or social work and in particular equal opportunities posts (Powney & Weiner 1992). They are often restricted to lower administrative grades, or to be found in specific universities, particularly the new universities in large metropolitan areas (Modood and Acland forthcoming).

Heidi Mirza (1997) suggests that this under-representation and niche positioning of black and minority ethnic staff seems anachronistic in the light of the surge of black and minority ethnic students into higher education which has occurred over the last 10 years (Modood 1993). The mismatch between increasing numbers of black and minority ethnic students and under-representation of black and minority ethnic staff persists despite the promotion and advocacy of equal opportunities in 96 per cent of higher education institutions (CUCO 1997; Farish *et al* 1995; Bonnett 1993; Leicester 1993).

Factors influencing educational careers of staff from minority groups

It could be argued that with the relatively recent migration and settlement of black and minority ethnic people in the UK - beginning in late 1950s - a critical mass of appropriately qualified black staff has not been available for academic, technical or related posts in higher education. Indeed many widening access initiatives have been aimed at redressing this shortfall by facilitating the entry of

black and minority ethnic students into higher education (Brennan and McGeevor 1990; Lyon 1988;1991; Storan and Gretton 1993; Taylor 1993). As indicated earlier in this review, the history of post colonial populations shows different arrival points and educational characteristics of minority groups which have consequences for their potential employment in further and higher education. Cultural, social and gender differences impinge on the staff profile and presence of minority ethnic groups in further and higher education.

Academics of minority ethnic origin are likely to experience patterns of discrimination and exclusionary practices which are particular to, and characterise, higher education work place culture (Mirza 1995; Powney and Weiner 1992; Farish *et al* 1995). Second and third generation British born black and minority ethnic people now aged between 24-40, are qualified to take up posts in technical, academic and related professions within the higher education sector. However it has been argued that these potential staff not only face the vagaries of contraction within the sector and the attendant insecurities of contract culture which are exclusionary in themselves - disrupting the traditional and theoretical notion of a progressive career. They also face the same unchallenged systems of patronage, privilege and discrimination that is known to be endemic within higher education (Giroux and McClaren 1994).

Patterns in employment in education are largely mirrored in the wider employment market. Heath and McMahon (1997) use the term 'ethnic penalty' to refer to all the sources of disadvantage that might lead an ethnic group to fare less well in the labour market than do similarly qualified white people (p91). They mention a range of research studies (including Mayhew and Rosewell, 1978, Brennan and McGeevor 1987) that in general found that an ethnic penalty *is* incurred by minority ethnic groups so that black people with a given level of education tend to have lower occupational attainments than do white people with the same qualifications. According to Heath and McMahon, this career situation has scarcely improved for those individuals and their minority ethnic groups born and educated in the UK and with familiarity with its cultures and language.

One (partly) Scottish study which corroborates the poor career prospects of individuals from minority ethnic groups was conducted by Farish *et al* (1995). The project comprised three case studies of equal opportunities practices in relation to staff in further and higher education in Britain and found near absence of black and minority ethnic staff in these sectors, partly as a consequence of differing relative educational capital and expectations and partly due to changing concepts of career. The methodology for this ESRC funded project does not allow for generalisations on the basis of quantitative data. However, clear examples of the gaps between stated policies and practices could be observed in detail and consideration given to some of the difficulties facing institutions trying to move towards more equal opportunities and facing individuals from various ethnic groups working in higher education. The particular case study carried out in a Scottish university found that issues associated with race and minority ethnic groups had an even lower profile than

gender issues which at that time revealed, in the eyes of the researchers, much poorer career, employment prospects and pay for female staff than for male staff. The position of staff from minority ethnic groups was not then on the agenda for the university:

> Indeed, the precise number of Black members of staff and of staff from minority ethnic backgrounds is not known, as records are not kept.
>
> (Farish *et al* 1995 p.72)

Without such data, it is impossible to monitor changes in personnel but it is apparent that in Scottish higher education there are few role models for students from minority ethnic groups among the staff who teach them. Now that HESA keep records on staff it should be easier to monitor the employment levels of academic staff who spend at least 25 per cent FTE time teaching. This will presumably exclude full time administrators, managers and researchers as well as technical and other support staff.

While analysis of staff figures may provide baseline data, even more revealing are studies into the implementation of policies in further and higher education. Turner *et al* (1996) reach the following conclusion from their audit of Scottish Further Education institutions:

- Evidence of antiracist institutional performance by (staff) respondents is not matched by policy implementation , monitoring and evaluation
- There is clear evidence that "other people" are described as dealing with (or are responsible for) key developmental issues e.g. recruitment, when in fact "other people" do not see themselves as responsible.
- Some acknowledge racist discrimination but are unsure about what action to take; some do not see a problem, a "colour blind " approach; some treat everyone alike because they believe that is black people's preference; some (few in number) are highly committed and active in bringing about change.
- Commitment to positive development is uneven at senior management level in terms of action and management motivation.
- There is evidence that non-academic staff are barely considered when anti-racist practice is considered.

These findings corroborate earlier work (Farish *et al)* in relation to HE and FE institutions and Powney and Weiner (1992) who also found that staff from minority ethnic groups felt isolated, subject to discrimination in relation to appointment and promotion and that their ethnic background – rather than other qualities or qualifications – was the key characteristic used in assessing their performance as managers.

There are differences between culturally distinctive groups and between males and females. For example, Mirza (1992,1995) argues that black female career motivation is essential to understanding the relative success of African-Caribbean women in education and work. Career motivation is characterised by three factors: firstly a notable drive for educational qualifications; secondly a unique outlook on the value of work; and thirdly the strategic rationalisation of

limited opportunities. The evidence (Owen, 1994; Blackburn *et al* 1997) suggests that black and minority ethnic peoples strive to achieve success through gaining educational qualifications despite their experience and knowledge of adverse circumstances in higher education.

Relating this to subsequent employment, Blackburn and colleagues noted that in every ethnic group, economically inactive men and women were less likely to be qualified than the active and those with higher qualifications were more likely to be active than those without (*op cit.* p248). Myers and Brown (1997) indicate that Owen's analysis of census data reveals women from minority ethnic groups comprise 0. 8 per cent of the total female economically active population and a fifth of these are self-employed. Proportionally more women from minority ethnic groups than white women were on a government training scheme.

The school sector

Little data is kept on the ethnic profile of the Scottish teaching force. The GTC keeps no such records and nor does every teachers' union. Exceptionally, EIS has published a policy, perspectives and recommendations on multicultural and racist education since 1987, monitors the ethnic background of members and runs an annual conference for black members of whom there are at least 200 across Scotland. The largest number work in Glasgow (79) and Edinburgh (25) with smaller numbers in Fife, South Lanarkshire and North Lanarkshire (10,11 and 13 respectively). Only four of the Unitary Authorities have no teachers from minority ethnic groups. (EIS figures May 1998). It should be noted however that some teachers are still reluctant to identify their ethnic background and therefore the numbers of teachers from minority ethnic groups is likely to be an under-estimate. EIS has established an anti-racist sub-committee of the Institute's Equal Opportunities Committee and, in 1997, inaugurated its Black Members Conference.

Overall however, black staff seem almost invisible in research and monitoring. For example, Critical Skills Development (1990) reported on a one year research project which considered the appointment of senior promoted staff in Scottish schools. On the basis of observing and interviewing members of appointment committees a set of guidelines was developed for future appointment procedures. The main recommendations make no specific reference to equal opportunities or ethnicity although the procedures advocated could advance equality of access.

There is undoubtedly low recruitment of both staff and students from minority groups in initial training and into teaching posts and other research questions related to this have been addressed in the earlier section on teacher education and staff development.

Emerging research issues

- What aspirations or targets do educational institutions have for the recruitment, retention and promotion of staff from minority ethnic groups?
- Is it true that equal opportunities legislation has had little impact as yet on the employment patterns of staff from minority ethnic groups employed in different areas of education in Scotland?
- What examples exist of good practice in the field of recruitment, staff development and promotion in Scottish education?
- Are the experiences of educational staff in Scotland reflecting implementation of the equal opportunities policies of their employers?

12 Methodology

Summary

- *Existing Scottish research into the education of minority ethnic groups in Scotland has made use of a wide range of standard social science research and evaluation approaches. There are also considerations of what might be special circumstances relating to Scotland compared with the rest of the UK.*
- *Researchers with an interest in this field face a number of difficulties.*
  - *Much statistical data routinely collected in Scotland does not include ethnicity as a variable. Audit and statistical analysis is therefore limited.*
  - *The small numbers of people from minority subgroups and the distinctive nature of these different groups can make it difficult to find reasonable sized samples or to produce findings which are generalisable.*
  - *It has proved difficult to gain access to some minority ethnic groups partly because of the nature of the selected sample.*
- *UK wide research may obscure differences between sub-groups of minority ethnic populations including those living in Scotland. In contrast there is the danger of over generalising from small scale studies.*
- *The studies carried out in Scotland as well as the rest of the UK make little concession to how the ethnic backgrounds of the researchers could be important factors in relation to research across different ethnic groups.*
- *The overall picture of educational research related to minority ethnic groups in Scotland reflects a problem based approach with theoretical assumptions remaining implicit. In developing a strategy for future research and priorities in this area, attention will also need to be given to ways of supporting appropriate and rigorous methods.*

Methods used in Scottish educational research

Existing Scottish research into the education of minority ethnic groups in Scotland has made use of a wide range of standard social science research and evaluation approaches. However there are also considerations of what might be special circumstances relating to Scotland compared with the rest of the UK and to the ethnicity of the participants in the research and of the researchers themselves. Fundamental questions also need to be asked about the assumptions underlying the research and the ways in which the research is initially formulated.

Reference has been made in this review to studies in Scotland and elsewhere that have used standard approaches to conducting educational research:

- *statistical analysis and audit*: e.g. CRE (1996) analysis of pupils from minority ethnic groups identified with special needs; Turner *et al* (1995 and 1997) approaches to equal opportunities by local authorities and further education colleges; Farish *et al* (1995) analysis of staff profiles in F/HE

- *surveys*: e.g. Conboy (1992) study of career advice; Smith (1991) interview survey of social contexts of ethnic minority and white groups
- *document analysis*: e.g. Adams and Landon (1992) critique of 5-14
- *interviewing*: e.g. Farish *et al* (1995) interviews of staff in higher education
- *observation*: e.g. Schaffer and colleagues in nursery settings -see Troyna and Edwards (1993)
- *case studies*: e.g. Witcher's description (1992) of implementing anti-racist policies in a school.

Quantitative methods and minority ethnic groups in Scotland

Researchers with an interest in this field face a number of difficulties. Much statistical data routinely collected in Scotland does not include ethnicity as a variable. A further problem is that the small numbers of people from minority subgroups and the distinctive nature of these different groups can make it difficult to find reasonable sized samples.

Statistical analysis with periodic audit comprises a particularly powerful approach based on solid evidence which provides a snapshot as well as the potential for examining trends over time. Straightforward comparisons can be made between a studied group (e.g. minority ethnic groups) and the main population or between the studied group and others sharing the same status or effects. In relation to examination candidates, for example, the Scottish Qualifications Authority statistics provide comprehensive information on candidates entered for public examinations and the results. Less comprehensive but still sufficiently robust for generalisation are the Scottish School Leavers Surveys and the AAP studies. Any statistical analysis is however dependent on the key variable, ethnicity, being identified in the first place and this is clearly absent in most educational monitoring in Scotland.

In their research review of gender equality in Scotland, Myers and Brown (1997) compare practices from different arena – including education, legal profession and justice, politics and local government, employment. This enables comparison of effective practices across different fields but also contributes to the whole picture of what in this case were the implications of gender for significant aspects of life. Such comparisons can be based on information in the public domain but not necessarily previously analysed for research purposes and could be one route to extend research related to education and minority ethnic groups - at least in those cases where ethnicity has been identified.

Sub-groups and problems of access

Although appropriate research methodologies are selected to match the particular circumstances of a study, these may not always guarantee successful outcomes. Some of the issues raised in research studies involving minority

ethnic groups relate to the size of the populations being studied, the accessibility of such groups and the interaction between the various participants in the research. The total population of people from minority ethnic groups living in Scotland is relatively small and made up of sub-groups with distinct cultural differences. It is therefore difficult to make valid comparisons between minority groups for example in relation to educational achievement or parental aspirations and between the minority groups and the dominant white cultural groups. It may not even be possible to find a reasonable sample of relevant people from minority ethnic groups – for example there are few in senior positions of employment in any sector of education (Farish *et al* 1995; Powney and Weiner 1992). An alternative applicable in some cases would be to use the whole of a specific minority group. For example, to examine the educational experiences of *all* African-Caribbean pupils in Scottish schools would be feasible given the total number of such pupils.

Inaccessibility of a different nature was encountered by Lloyd and Norris in the Scottish Traveller Education Project (STEP) where the Gypsy-Traveller communities in Scotland proved very elusive and the researchers managed to get only low survey returns.

Issues arising from UK wide research

Looking at the broader picture of research in the UK in this field, a range of factors have been identified which illustrate its complexity. Difficulties can arise in quantitative studies if analyses generalise findings beyond the population being sampled; and yet larger studies may obscure differences between sub-groups.

If findings in small scale local studies are, for example, assumed to apply to all white people, all African-Caribbean boys or Muslim girls, such over-generalisations are easy to spot. It may be more difficult where findings related to the whole population are assumed to be pertinent to sub-groups. Phillips (1987) for example drew attention to her own assumptions that experiences of women in part-time jobs in Britain pertained to women as a whole whereas her work really reflects white women's experience since black women are much more likely to work full time. The ways in which race, class and gender differences are analysed can produce different kinds of equalities. This is shown in grouping together the attainment of pupils from minority ethnic groups when more subtle analysis shows significant differences in attainment between diverse groups and sometimes within these groups between males and females. For example, Modood's analyses (1993) show that any general statement on the relative over-representation of minority ethnic groups in higher education can conceal the considerable differences between groups and between for example, Bangladeshi women and men.

A related aspect is the extent to which ethnicity is addressed as a variable in research examining gender or class. For example, the careful study of women and management in further education by Eileen Turner and her colleagues

(1996) provides helpful suggestions for encouraging more women into further education but does not address the rather different situations facing black women seeking advancement in their educational careers as identified for example, in Powney and Weiner (1992).

Ethnic background of researchers – a variable

The studies carried out in Scotland as well as the rest of the UK make little concession to how the ethnic backgrounds of the researchers could be important factors in relation to research across different ethnic groups.

An absent but pertinent issue in reviewing research concerning minority ethnic groups is the extent to which the perspective which frames the research is likely to change significantly the outcomes of the research. Lawrence (1982) notes

> the tendency of white sociologists to obscure the question of their relationship to the black people they study; a relationship that is structured by racism.
> (see Edwards 1990 p478)

While this can refer to the framing of the overarching research questions by researchers from the dominant culture, it is also pertinent at the micro-level of the match between interviewer and interviewee or the framing of detailed survey questions:

> Characteristics such as class, sex, and race belong not just to the people who we conduct our research on or about, but are also characteristics of the researchers. (Edwards 1990 p.482)

There are assumptions that the closer the match in terms of gender and ethnicity of interviewer and interviewee, the better the relationship and the more relaxed and willing to talk will be the person being interviewed. As a white woman, Edwards (*ibid*) experienced considerable difficulty in gaining the confidence of mature black women students in higher education. Although she had shared understandings of being mature and a mother, she had no understanding of what this meant from a black perspective (p.483). Potential interviewees also resented what they perceived as hierarchical differences between themselves as students and the middle class academic who was interviewing them. In a UK wide study (Powney and Weiner 1992) of managers in education who were female and/or from black minority groups, an agreement was made within the research team that black researchers would interview black managers and white, white. However this left black male managers being interviewed by black female researchers. Had we pursued this further, it would have been logical to ensure that Muslims were interviewed by Muslims, second generation African-Caribbeans by interviewers from this group and so on. The issues concern how researchers can address the inevitable gulfs there are between themselves and their informants, how they can cope with the disadvantages as well as the advantages of sharing common experiences and/or cultures (Powney and Watts 1987).

We take this further and ask the question 'Is Scottish research racist?' in the sense that most researchers are white and research issues are overwhelmingly determined by the dominant white population. Connolly and Troyna (1998) suggested that until the early 1980s mainstream research had largely produced very stereotypical accounts of minority ethnic communities which simply reflected and endorsed racist assumptions of the wider population. This put the onus for any disadvantages experienced by minority groups on them and ignored the prejudice, racism and discrimination operating throughout society. By the end of the 1990s the same authors report there is more subtle recognition of;

> the complex nature of racism, its diverse and context-specific forms and the way that it is crucially intersected and transformed by the cross cutting influences of gender, class, ethnicity and sexuality.
>
> (Connolly and Troyna 1998 p2)

Scottish educational research has still not realised this level of subtlety.

Emerging research issues

- How can the quality and quantity of educational research in relation to minority ethnic groups in Scotland be enhanced?
- What is the influence of cultural and racial diversity on the definition of the research agenda and the conduct of research?

13 Towards a New Research Agenda

As this review has clearly demonstrated most of the Scottish work in the area of education and minority ethnic groups has been small scale, conducted by committed and enthusiastic, individuals usually with minimal resources. Because research in this area has tended to be pragmatic and problem-based and therefore almost parochial, it has made little contribution to vigorous, theoretical debate concerning education and minority groups such as stimulated shifts in the emphasis of research and educational provision in England from multi-cultural to anti-racist issues. However this somewhat doleful picture does have the advantage of providing a new opportunity to develop a strategy for ensuring that there is support for all researchers to deploy appropriate and rigorous methods as well as for defining priorities for research topics.

Given the paucity of existing research concerning the education of pupils and students from minority ethnic groups, a possible research agenda emerges as a very long shopping list. Throughout the review we have tried to identify key issues and topics emerging from research undertaken so far in Scotland and elsewhere. Listed below is a combination of issues arising directly from the desk exercise in the review and from suggestions put forward by key informants whom we consulted about their concerns related to education and minority ethnic groups. While the agenda is long, that does not mean it is comprehensive but rather is intended to convey to a variety of audiences the breadth of issues concerning the education of pupils and students from minority ethnic groups.

Monitoring information

As yet basic information is not available and it is suggested that the statistical information available from the Scottish Office and other databases in Scotland should include information and analyses of ethnicity related to:

(a) Scottish pupils' stages of education and their attainment

(b) Scottish teachers including level and area of work

(c) school leavers and their post-school destinations

(d) parents in PTAs and School Boards

(e) access and attainment in further and higher education

(f) the level and area of work of staff in further and higher education.

What examples are there of effective statistical monitoring of pupils' educational experiences and attainment at school? How might these be extended across Scotland?

How have the new authorities tried to meet the requirements of the Race Relations Acts 1968 and 1976 in relation to education? What has been the impact of local government reorganisation on the delivery of equality of opportunity in Scottish education authorities?

Access

A closer definition of the Scottish picture in relation to minority ethnic access to the range of educational services and provision would also suggest what measures are necessary to increase the information available on, and knowledge of, educational provision among minority ethnic groups.

Why are certain minority ethnic groups substantially more likely to be found in higher education than their equivalent white counterparts? What steps can be taken to smooth the entry for minority ethnic groups into all levels of education?

Learning and teaching: ethos

As indicated in the review, school, colleges, universities, local authorities and other groups concerned with education (for example, GTC, SCCC, COSLA) publish their equal opportunities polices in mission statements, prospectuses, job advertisements and statements of intent. Sometimes these statements can be accompanied by suggestions for how to implement these intentions but without any monitoring or evaluation of effectiveness. However, as Farish *et al* (1995) found, scrutiny of practice can reveal shortcomings and obstacles to improving the situation for those from minority ethnic groups as well as providing examples of action that could be useful for others. What are the relationships between the policy statements issued by organisations concerned with education and the practices of these organisations? What examples of effective practices in different educational settings are revealed by evaluation of the implementation of multi-cultural and anti-racist education (MCARE) policies and guidelines?

In addition to the need for systematic evaluation of anti-racist policy there is also a lack of research into the ethnic minority experience of education which would enable policy makers and practitioners to target inequalities more effectively. In recent years, English researchers have focused on 'the subtle range of processes, nuances and meaning that underpin minority students' experiences of schooling' (Connolly and Troyna 1998) primarily through the use of qualitative research methods, in particular ethnographic studies. Studies of this type would complement policy evaluation and help to identify issues of particular relevance to Scotland (reducing current reliance on English studies developed in a different context). What are the views and experiences of black/minority ethnic pupils in Scottish education?

Racism is a largely neglected area in research related to school ethos and does not provide a basis for teachers to develop anti-racist strategies. Moreover, many Scottish people, including teachers, will have had little, if any, contact with people from minority ethnic cultures and may have little accurate knowledge about differences and similarities in custom, religion, values and educational aspirations of people from various ethnic groups compared with each other and with the majority population. What are the levels of knowledge and understanding of other cultures among teachers and children in Scotland? How

do schools (especially primary schools) foster values concerned with multi-cultural and anti-racist issues? To what extent are school staff aware of racist incidents which affect pupils? How do staff deal with racism and enable all pupils to enjoy their school and find it a safe and comfortable place to be?

Peer relations in multi-racial classrooms could provide evidence of positive school ethos. A worthwhile focus for any study of this area is how teachers and others in the community have successfully fostered good relationships among pupils of different ethnic backgrounds.

Learning and teaching: the curriculum

As so little published research is related to curriculum issues and the education of minority ethnic groups in Scotland, the potential agenda for research in this area is immense. The main issue is how to make the curriculum reflect more strongly the culture and experiences of all the communities living in Scotland.

Certainly a review should be undertaken of the implications for pupils from minority backgrounds in the implementation of any curricula – 5–14, Standard and Higher Grade and Higher Still. Part of this review might deal with issues of pupils' access to subject options, work experience and extra-curricular activities at school.

Participants in a conference organised by The Black Community Development Project, Greater Pilton in 1997 advocated the need for multi-cultural and anti-racist materials across all areas of the curriculum. Schools might undertake an audit of how minority ethnic groups are portrayed (or are absent) in texts, videos and other materials used in all subjects. This could provide the basis for action in future school development planning which puts as a priority multi-cultural and anti-racist education.

Learning and teaching: home and school

In spite of high parental aspirations among minority ethnic communities and considerable commitment to their children's education, the research suggests that professionals are unaware of the specific needs and interest of minority ethnic parents in this context and therefore fail to provide relevant information and support. Further research into their professional development needs in this area would therefore be valuable.

Further information about parental expectations in the various minority ethnic communities about schooling and parental influences on attainment would complement this work.

Evidence suggests that some people from minority ethnic groups who are living in need are not drawing benefits to which they are entitled. Does this also apply to educational support services?

Learning and teaching: language issues

Pupils who regularly use more than one language are demonstrating considerable linguistic skills. It would be helpful to have better understanding of the positive effects, as well as the disadvantages, of bilingualism on learning from pre-school, through compulsory schooling and in further and higher education.

Lack of research into the linguistic needs and interests of the various ethnic minority groups in Scotland makes it difficult to establish appropriate provision to support the development of community languages. A national picture of 'the other languages of Scotland', including patterns of use, provision of teaching and an account of needs and interests not currently met, would be of immense value in this context.

While ESL provision is well-established in areas of Scotland where there are sufficient numbers of bilingual children to warrant it, there is no clear account of the current nature of provision in primary and secondary schools or of its impact on bilingual pupils. Research into these issues is also needed.

Learning and teaching: teacher education and staff development

Teacher training programmes may include reference to minority ethnic groups but what are the effects of initial and inservice multi-cultural and anti-racist programmes for teachers on their subsequent teaching and their students' learning? How can schools and teacher training institutions provide support for pupils and students from minority ethnic groups on work experience and school placements?

There is low recruitment of students and teachers from minority ethnic groups. Research into the career profiles of these students and teachers could illuminate the perceived obstacles to their entry and advancement in the profession and factors that could enhance their careers. What is the distribution of teachers from minority groups in terms of age, gender, promoted posts, subjects and sectors of schooling?

Attainment

David Gillborn (1992) argues that young people from minority ethnic groups are likely to be unfairly disadvantaged wherever students are sorted according to a behavioural or academic standard which is defined by the majority, white population. Academic selection can therefore contribute to institutional racism. What contributions do social, cultural and economic factors make to educational attainment?

What monitoring and recording procedures need to be established to support independent Scottish research on attainment and ethnicity? Can a common set of criteria be arrived at to accomplish this at institutional, local authority and national levels and across different departments or subject areas? Is there likely

to be any bias in assessment which might, for example, suggest the need for anonymous marking of examination scripts?

The 1991 Patten Smith report suggests that minority ethnic groups are relatively well represented as students in higher education in Scotland. What are less clear are the subsequent career patterns of these students once qualified. What jobs do they take up and where? Do they successfully obtain posts for which they are qualified or do they transfer to another professional field or job?

Ethnicity and educational employment

In relation to staff working in educational institutions, key informants emphasised the need to train all personnel - not just teachers - and that policies and training have to be set in a Scottish context. This raises questions about the aspirations and targets that educational institutions have for the recruitment, retention and promotion of staff from minority ethnic groups. Is it true that equal opportunities legislation has had little impact as yet on the employment patterns of staff from minority ethnic groups employed in different areas of education in Scotland? Is there evidence of "'ghettoisation" of professionals from minority groups? What is their participation in mainstream primary and secondary schools, special needs provision and in other educational services e.g. HMI; advisory services; administration; psychological services? What are their educational career patterns and experiences?

It would be useful to present examples of good practice in the field of recruitment, staff development and promotion in Scottish education and to explore how the professional associations might support teachers from minority ethnic groups as well as encourage them to participate in the affairs of the associations? Are the experiences of educational staff in Scotland reflecting implementation of the equal opportunities policies of their employers?

Methodology

This review has indicated the variability in Scottish research related to minority ethnic groups which reflects its low priority in mainstream research. Most studies are small scale and undertaken by committed individuals, often in their own time and with little material support. How can the quality and quantity of educational research in relation to minority ethnic groups in Scotland be enhanced? Is action research an appropriate approach for school based studies concerned with education and minority ethnic groups?

The influence of cultural and racial diversity on the definition of the research agenda and the conduct of research cannot be ignored and yet there are practical difficulties that need to be addressed. Some strategic thinking is required on how best to give greater priority to research and evaluation related to the education of people from minority ethnic groups and to demonstrate what can be done to promote good education for all pupils and students in Scotland.

References

ADAMS, A. and LANDON, J. (1992) 'Curriculum 5-14 developments: a critical review.' In Conference Report on *The 5-14 Programme and the elimination of racial discrimination in Scottish schools?* Edinburgh: Moray House Institute of Education.

ALMEIDA DINIZ, F. (1996) 'Education policy and black/ minority communities in Scotland: Participation, monitoring and parental advocacy.' Keynote address to Lothian Racial Equality Council AGM, 24 July 1996.

ALMEIDA DINIZ, F. (1997a) 'Parental advocacy in decision-making in Special Education'. Paper given at the *Exclusion and Choice: Politics and Processes* seminar. Napier and Stirling Universities. (February)

ALMEIDA DINIZ, F. (1997b) 'Working with families in a multi-ethnic European context: implications for services' in Carpenter, B (ed) *Families in Context: Emerging Trends in Family Support and Early Intervention'.*

ALMEIDA DINIZ, F. (1997c) 'The social exclusion of black/bilingual children: The case of Special Education provision'. *Conference: Equality in Education - Towards the next Millennium. Collaborating to combat Racism and Xenophobia* 1997 European Year Against Racism.

ARORA, R. K. (1986) 'Initial teacher training: A case study of a decade of change in Bradford' in ARORA, R. K. and DUNCAN, C. G. (eds) *op. cit.*

ARORA, R. K. and DUNCAN, C. G. (ed) (1986) *Multicultural Education: Towards good practice* London Routledge and Kegan Paul

ARROWSMITH, J. and GEARNS, J. (1994) *Family Involvement in Primary School Education Focus 3: Families in an identified area with significant numbers of minority ethnic groups.* Department of Social Science Work, 1993/4. Moray House Institute of Education, Heriot-Watt University.

ARSHAD, R. (1992) 'The interconnections of gender, class and anti-racist education policy into practice.' In Brown, S. and Riddell, S. (eds.): *Class, Race and Gender in Schools.* Edinburgh: SCRE.

ASSISTANT MASTERS and MISTRESSES ASSOCIATION (1987) *Cultural and Anti-Racist Education Today: An AMMA Statement* AMMA.

BACK, L. (1990) *Racist Name Calling and Developing Anti-Racist Initiatives in Youth Work.* Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations. Research Paper in Ethnic Relations No. 14. November. ESRC.

BAGLEY, C. A. (1992) *Back to the Future.* Section 11 of the Local Government Act 1966: LEAs and Multicultural/Antiracist Education. NFER.

BAKSHI, N (1992) 'A personal perspective'. In Conference Report on *The 5-14 Programme and the elimination of racial discrimination in Scottish schools?* Edinburgh: Moray House Institute of Education.

BALL, W. (1986) *Policy Innovation on Multicultural Education in 'Eastshire' Local Education Authority.* Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations. Policy Papers in Ethnic Relations No. 4. March. ESRC.

BALL, W. (1987) *Post-Sixteen Education and the Promotion of Equal Opportunities: A case study of policies and provision in one Local Authority.* Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations. Policy Papers in Ethnic Relations No. 8. January. ESRC.

BECKER, H. (1952) 'Social Class Variations in the Teacher-Pupil Relationship' in *Journal of Educational Sociology* (5).

BELL, A. (ed) (1991) *Aspects of Racism* Edinburgh, Moray House Institute of Education.

BERNSTEIN, B. (1995) *Towards a Theory of Educational Transmission*, Volume 3 Routlege and Kegan Paul.

BLACK COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT PROJECT (1997) *Communities Against Racism: conference report.*

BLACK COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT PROJECT (1998) *Second Needs Survey Report* Black Community Development Project: Craigroyston Community High School, Edinburgh.

BLACKBURN, R. M., DALE, A. and JARMAN, J. (1997) 'Ethnic differences in attainment in education, occupation and life-style' in KARN, V. (ed) (1997) *Ethnicity in the 1991 Census. Volume Four: Employment, education and housing among the ethnic minority population of Britain.* Office for National Statistics. London The Stationery Office.

BLAIR, M. and MAYLOR, U. (1993) Issues and concerns for black women teachers in training, in Siraj-Blatchford, I (ed) *Race, Gender and the Education of Teachers*, Buckingham, Open University Press.

BOURDIEU, P. and PASSERON, J. (1977) *Reproduction in Education, Society and Culture.* Sage Publications, London.

BOURNE, J. (1989) *Moving into the Mainstream.* Windsor. NFER-Nelson.

BOURNE, J. and McPAKE, J (1991) *Partnership Teaching: Co-operative teaching strategies in multilingual classrooms*, HMSO

BRENNAN, J. and McGEEVOR, P (1990) *Ethnic Minorities and the Graduate Labour Market.* London: CRE.

BROWN, S. and RIDDELL, S. (1992) (eds.) *Class, Race and Gender in Schools: A New Agenda for Policy and Practice in Scottish Education.* SCRE, Edinburgh.

CENTRE FOR EDUCATION FOR RACIAL EQUALITY IN SCOTLAND (CERES) (1992) *5–14 Developments and the Elimination of Racial Discrimination within Scottish Education.* Edinburgh, Moray House Institute of Education.

CENTRE FOR EDUCATION FOR RACIAL EQUALITY IN SCOTLAND (CERES) (1994) *Meeting the Needs of Pre-five Black/minority Ethnic Children in Central Region.* Edinburgh. CERES, Moray House Institute of Education.

CENTRE FOR EDUCATION FOR RACIAL EQUALITY IN SCOTLAND (CERES) (1998) *Response from the Centre for Education for Racial Equality Scotland* to the "Social Exclusion in Scotland Consultation Paper' March 1998

CHAUDHRY, F. (1996) *Race and Poverty in Strathclyde: Issues and opportunities*, Strathclyde Poverty Alliance.

CHILDLINE (1998) *Children and Racism* London, Childline

CHURCH OF SCOTLAND (1990) *Report of Board of Education Committee on Multicultural Education.* Edinburgh. Church of Scotland.

COMMISSION FOR RACIAL EQUALITY (1985): *Swann: a response from the Commission for Racial Equality.* CRE. London.

COMMISSION FOR RACIAL EQUALITY (1991) *Code of Practice (Scotland) for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination in Education.* London: CRE.

COMMISSION FOR RACIAL EQUALITY (1992) *Ethnic Monitoring in Educaltion.* London: CRE.

COMMISSION FOR RACIAL EQUALITY (1996a) *From Cradle to School: A practical guide to racial equality in early childhood education and care London* CRE.

COMMISSION FOR RACIAL EQUALITY (1996b) *Special Educational Need Assessment in Strathclyde. Report of a formal investigation.* London: CRE.

COMMISSION FOR RACIAL EQUALITY (1997) *Special Educational Need Assessment in Strathclyde. A year on. Analysis of the impact of the report.* Edinburgh: CRE.

COMMISSION ON UNIVERSITY CAREER OPPORTUNITY (CUCO) (1997) *A Report on the Policies and Practices on Equal Opportunities in Employment in Universities and Colleges in Higher Education.* CVCP.

CONBOY, M. (1992) *Still Not An Issue? Ethnic minority youth employment in Central Scotland* Stirling, Central Scotland Race Equality Council.

CONNOLLY, P. and TROYNA, B. (1998) *Researching Racism in Education: Politics, theory and practice* Buckingham Open University Press.

CORNER, T. (1987) *Ethnic Minority School-Leavers in Strathclyde Region.* Multicultural and International Education Unit, University of Glasgow.

CORNER, T. and JOHNSON, A. (1984) *Issues in Multicultural and Anti-Racist Education in Scotland.* Scottish Educational Association (SERA) in Association with National Association for Multiracial Education (NAME) Glasgow Branch.

COULTAS, V. (1989) Black Girls and Self Esteem, in *Gender and Education* Vol 1 (3) 1989.

CRAFT, A. and BARDELL, G. (eds) (1984) *Curriculum Opportunities in a Multicultural Society* Harper Row.

CRITICAL SKILLS DEVELOPMENT (1990) *Selecting Staff. A Guide to the appointment of senior promoted staff in Scottish schools.* Edinburgh.

CROSS, M. A (1987) *Cause for Concern: Ethnic minority youth and vocational training policy.* Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations. Policy Papers in Ethnic Relations No. 9. January. ESRC.

CROXFORD, L. (1994) 'Equal Opportunities in the Secondary - School Curriculum in Scotland 1977-91' in *British Educational Research Journal* Vol 20 (4).

CUMMINS, J. (1973) 'A theoretical perspective on the relationship between bilingualism and thought.' *Working papers on bilingualism 1:* 1-9.

CUMMINS, J. (1976) 'The influence of bilingualism on cognitive growth: a synthesis of research findings and explanatory hypotheses.' *Working Papers on Bilingualism 9:* 1-43.

CUMMINS, J. (1978) 'Bilingualism and the development of metalinguistic awareness'. *Journal of Cross-cultural Psychology 9:* 139-149.

CUMMINS, J. (1979) 'Linguistic interdependence and the educational development of bilingual children. *Review of Educational Research 49:* 222-251.

CUMMINS, J. (1981) 'The role of primary language development in promoting educational success for language minority students.' *California State Department of Education. Schooling and Language Minority Students: A theoretical framework.* Los Angeles. Evaluation, Assessment and Dissemination Center.

CUMMINS, J. (1984) 'Wanted: a theoretical framework for relating language proficiency to academic achievement among bilingual students.' In C. Rivera (ed.): *Language Proficiency and Academic Achievement.* Clevedon. Multilingual Matters.

DE LEMOS, M. M. (1975) *Study of the Educational Achievement of Migrant Children.* Australian Council for Educational Research, Melbourne.

DE LIMA, P. AND INGRAM, A. (1992) 'Bilingualism'. In Conference Report on *The 5-14 Programme and the elimination of racial discrimination in Scottish schools?* Edinburgh. Moray House Institute of Education.

DEPARTMENT FOR EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT (1997) *Study of Modern Apprenticeships and People from Ethnic Minorities* Quality and Performance Improvement Division. Moorfoot Sheffield.

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE (DES) (1975) *A Language for Life.* (The Bullock Report). London: HMSO.

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE (DES) (1985) *Education for All.* (The Swann Report). London: HMSO.

DICKSON, A. (1995) *Positive Action in Community Education: Strategy for Employing Black and Ethnic Minorities.* East Dunbartonshire Council.

DONALD, P., GOSLING, S. and HAMILTON, J. (1995) 'No problem here? Children's attitudes to race in a mainly white area. Edinburgh: SCRE *Spotlight.*

DOUGLAS J. W. B. (1964) *The Home and the School,* MacGibbon and Key, London.

DREW, D., GRAY, J. and SPORTON, D. (1997) 'Ethnic differences in the educational participation of 16-19 year-olds', in KARN V. (ed) *Using the 1991 Census to study Ethnicity,* Office for National Statistics, London.

DRIVER G. and BALLERD R. Contemporary performance in multi racial schools: South Asian pupils at 16 plus in A. James and R Jeffcoate (eds) 1981). *The School in the Multicultural Society: a reader* Harper & Row, Open University Press.

DRURY, B. *Education, The Education Reform Act (1988) and Racial Equality. A Conference Report.* Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations. Occasional Paper in Ethnic Relations No. 7. June 1992. ESRC.

EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTE OF SCOTLAND (EIS) (1986) *EIS policy paper on MCARE.* Oban. EIS.

EDWARDS, R. (1990) Connecting method and epistemology: A white woman interviewing black women. *Women's Studies International Forum* Vol 13 (5) pp477-490.

EDWARDS, V. (1998) *The Power of Babel. Teaching and learning in multilingual classrooms.* Stoke-on-Trent: Trentham Books.

EGGLESTON, J. (1992) *The Challenge for Teachers* Cassell.

EPSTEIN, D. (1993) *Changing Classroom Cultures: anti-racism, politics and schools.* Stoke on Trent Trentham Books.

EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES COMMISSION (1995a) *Further Education and Quality. A manager's guide* Manchester EOC/CRE.

EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES COMMISSION (1995b) *Quality Through Equality* Good practice in equal opportunities in Scottish local authorities. Glasgow: EOC

EYSENCK H. (1971) *Race Intelligence and Education*, Temple Smith, London.

FARISH, M., McPAKE, J., POWNEY, J. and WEINER, G.(1995) *Equal Opportunities in Colleges and Universities. Towards Better Practices.* The Society for Research into Higher Education and Open University Press.

FIFE REGIONAL COUNCIL (1991) *Race Equality in Fife.* Glenrothes. Fife Regional Council.

FINLAY A. C. (1992) *Factors Influencing the Retention and Progression of Immigrant Asian Women in Programmes of Adult and Continuing Education.* Unpublished MEd thesis, Institute of Educational Studies, University of Glasgow.

FINN, G.P.T.(1987) 'Multicultural Anti-racism and Scottish Education' in *Scottish Educational Review* Vol 19 (1) pp 39 - 49

FITZPATRICK, F. (1987) *The Open Door.* Clevedon. Multilingual Matters

FRASER, M. (1992) 'CRE Code of Practice for Scotland - the Links.' In Conference Report on *The 5-14 Programme and the elimination of racial discrimination in Scottish schools?* Edinburgh. Moray House Institute of Education.

GARNER, C. L. and RAUDENBUSH, S. W. (1991) " Neighbourhood effects on educational attainment. A multi level analysis, *Sociology of Education*, 64: pp251-262

GENERAL TEACHING COUNCIL (GTC) (1994) *Multicultural anti-racist education: a GTC policy document.* GTC. Edinburgh.

GILL, D. (1983) Assessment in Geography for a Multicultural Society.

GILL, D., MAYOR, B. and BLAIR, M. (eds)(1992) *Racism and Education; Structures and strategies.* London: Sage.

GILLBORN, D. (1992) Racism and education: Issues for research and practice, in Brown, S. and Riddell, S. (eds.) *Class, Race and Gender in Schools: A new agenda for policy and practice in Scottish education*. SCRE, Edinburgh.

GILLBORN, D. (1995) 'Racism and exclusions from school: case studies in the denial of educational opportunity'. Paper presented at the *European Conference on Educational Research* (ECER 1995), University of Bath.

GILLIES, A. (1989) 'Achievement in SCE Exams by pupils from an Asian Background in Five Glasgow Schools'. SCRE *Spotlight* No. 20.

GIROUX, H and McCLAREN, P (1994) *Between Borders: Pedagogy and the politics of cultural studies*

GOULBOURNE, H and LEWIS-MEEKS, P. *Access of Ethnic Minorities to Higher Education in Britain: report of a seminar at King's College, Cambridge*. Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations. Occasional Papers in Ethnic Relations No 10. ESRC.

GRANT, N. (1992): '"Scientific" racism: what price objectivity?' In *Scottish Educational Review* 24 (1)

GRAVELLE, M. (1996) *Supporting Bilingual Learners in Schools*. Stoke-on-Trent: Trentham Books.

GREAT BRITAIN STATUTES (1966) *The Local Government Act: 1966*. London: HMSO.

HALSEY, A. H., HEATH, A. F. and RIDGE, J. M. (1980) *Origins and Destinations*, Clarendon Press, Oxford.

HAMERS, J.F. and BLANC, M.H.A. (1989) *Bilinguality and bilingualism*. Cambridge. Cambridge: University Press.

HAMPTON, K. and BAIN, J. (1995) *Poverty and Ethnic Minorities in Scotland: a review of literature*, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research research paper: No 4 (Series 2).

HAMPTON, K., TROUP, G. and WALSH, D. (1997) *Increasing Access to Higher Education in Glasgow for Ethnic Minority Students. Report 2: The empirical findings*. Glasgow. Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit Research Unit Research Paper No. 6 (series 2).

HANLEY, E. (1969) 'Scotland: avoiding English mistakes.' In *Race Today* 1 (1).

HARLEN, W (1996) *Four Years of Change in Education 5-14*. Edinburgh: SCRE

HAWKES, N. (1994) 'Race and education in Scotland.' In *European Journal of Intercultural Studies* 5 (2).

HEATH, A. and McMAHON, D. (1997) 'Education and occupational attainments: the impact of ethnic origins' in KARN, V (ed) (1997) *Ethnicity in the 1991 census. Volume Four Employment, education and housing among the ethnic minority population of Britain*. Office for National Statistics. London The Stationery Office.

HICKS, D. (1981) *Bias in Geography Books* Institute of Education, London

INGRAM, A. (1991): An analysis of ESL provision in Drummond Community High School. Edinburgh. Lothian TVEI Extension Scheme.

INSTITUTE OF RACE RELATIONS (1982) *Patterns of racism*.

INTERFACE (1997) Gypsies and Travellers. education, training, youth, *Interface Newsletter* 26 May. Gypsy Research Centre, Paris

JENSEN A. (1973) *Educational Differences*, Methuen, London

JIWA, S. (1994) *Mother Tongue Learning: A study of the learning needs of the Pakistani, Indian and Bangladeshi communities in Edinburgh*. The University of Edinburgh Centre for Continuing Education. Occasional Papers Series: No 5. October.

JOHNSTONE, R. (1994): The impact of current developments to support the Gaelic language: a review of research. Stirling: Scottish CILT.

JONES, C, MAGUIRE, M. AND WATSON, B (1996) 'Becoming a teacher: The in-school experiences of black and other minority student teachers.' Paper presented at *Annual BERA Conference*, University of Lancaster, September.

JONES, T. (1993) *Britain's Ethnic Minorities*, Policy Studies Institute, London.

JORDAN, E. and CARROLL, L *(1994) Patterns of Attendance of Show Children in 4 Glasgow Secondary Schools, 1988-1993*. Scottish Traveller Education Project (STEP), Moray House Institute, Heriot-Watt University. October,

KAIFI, R. (1993) *'Special educational needs of Asian pupils'* Unpublished undergraduate thesis Dundee University

KARN, V. (ed) (1997) *Ethnicity in the 1991 census. Volume Four Employment, education and housing among the ethnic minority population of Britain.* Office for National Statistics. London The Stationery Office.

KARN, V. (1997) 'Ethnic penalties' and racial discrimination in education, employment and housing: conclusions and policy implications, in KARN, V(ed) *op cit*

KARN, V, DALE, A. and RATCLIFFE, P. (1997) 'Using the 1991 Census to study ethnicity' in KARN (ed) *op. cit.*

KENNEDY, C. (1996) *Schooling and Ethnic background*, Unpublished MEd thesis School of education, University of Glasgow.

KLEIN, G. (1984) *Reading into Racism: Bias in children's literature and learning materials* London Routledge and Kegan Paul

KLEIN, G. (1986) 'Resources for multicultural education' in Arora, R. K and Duncan, C. (ed) *op. cit.*

KNOX, A. and SIANN, G. (1994) *Influences on Career Choice: The Responses of Ethnic Minority and Ethnic Majority Girls*. Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit Paper: No 11.

LAMBERT, W.E. AND TUCKER, G.R. (1972): Bilingual education of children: The St Lambert experiment. Rowley, Mass. Newbury House.

LEICESTER, M. (1993) *Race for Change in Continuing and Higher Education* Buckingham, Open University Press.

LINGUISTIC MINORITIES PROJECT (1985): The other languages of England. London. Routledge & Kegan Paul.

LITTLE, T. (1998) Racism still alive on the campus. *The Scotsman* 28 January.

LLOYD, G. and NORRIS, C. *From Difference to Deviance: The Exclusion of Gypsy - Traveller Children from School in Scotland.* (Unpublished).

LOTHIAN REGIONAL COUNCIL (1987) *Guidelines for Education - In and For a Multicultural Society* Lothian Regional Council; Advisory Service.

LOTHIAN REGIONAL COUNCIL (1988) *Mainly about Fiction – Primary Language Guidelines* Lothian Regional Council; Regional Consultative Committee on Primary Education.

LUTHRA, M. and OAKLEY, R. (1991) *Combating Racism Through Training: A Review of approaches to race training in organisations.* Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations. Policy Paper in Ethnic Relations No. 22. June. ESRC.

LYNN, P. (1995) *The 1993 Leavers.* Scottish Office Education Department.

LYON, S (1988) Unequal Opprtunities: Black minorities and access to higher education' *Journal for Further and Higher Education* 2 (3) pp 20-36

LYON, S (1991) Black minority students and higher education' in Calder, J *The Disaffected Learner* London: Falmer Press.

MAAN, B. (1992) *The New Scots. The story of Asians in Scotland.* Edinburgh. John Donald Publishers.

MAC AN GHAILL, M. (1992) Coming of age in 1980s England: reconceptualising black students' schooling experience in D, Gill B. Mayor and M. Blair (eds) *Racism and Education: Structures and strategies* London Sage)

MacBEATH, J. and ROBERTSON, P. (1995) *Reporting 5-14: Evaluation of the Implementation of the 5-14 Development Programme* Quality in Education Centre, University of Strathclyde.

MacBEATH, J., MEARNS, D. and SMITH, M. (1986) *Home from school.* Glasgow. Jordanhill College of Education.

MacEWEN, M. (1986) *Register of Research.* Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit.

MacINTOSH, M. (1992) 'Bringing about change in the culture of a school.' In Brown, S. and Riddell, S. (eds.): *op. cit.*

MacINTOSH, N. J., MACIE-TAYLOR, C. G. and WEST, A. M. (1988) 'West Indian and Asian children's educational attainment', in Verma, G. and Pumfrey, P (eds.), *Educational Attainments, Issues and Outcomes in Multi-Cultural Education.* Lewes Falmer Press.

MACKAY, P. (1989) *Children's Fiction for a Multicultural Society* Lothian Regional Council; Advisory Service

MAYHEW, K and ROSEWELL, B (1978) 'Immigrants and occupational crowding'. Oxford Bulletin of Econonmics and Statistics, 40 pp223-49

McFARLAND, E. and WALSH (1995) *Refugees in Strathclyde.* Glasgow. Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit.

McPAKE, J and POWNEY, J (1995) *The Educational Experiences of Japanese Children at School in the UK.* ESRC Report

McPAKE, J. and POWNEY, J. (1998) 'A mirror to ourselves? The experience of Japanese children at school in the UK.' *Educational Research* 40 (2) pp169-179

McPHERSON, A. (1983) 'An angle on the geist: persistence and change in Scottish educational tradition.' In Humes, W. and Paterson, H. (eds.) *Scottish Culture and Scottish Education 1800 - 1980.* Edinburgh. John Donald Publishers.

MEEK, M. (1996): Developing pedagogies in the multilingual classroom. The writings of Josie Levine. Stoke-on-Trent. Trentham Books.

MILES, R. and DUNLOP, A. (1987) 'Racism in Britain: the Scottish dimension.' In Jackson, P. (ed.): *Race and Racism.* London. Allen and Unwin.

MILNER, D. (1975) *Children and Race* Harmondsworth. Penguin Books.

MILNER, D. (1982) *Children and Race... Ten years on.* Ward Lock Education, Penguin Books.

MIRZA, A. A. (1997) *Sex Education: A comparative study of the perceptions, attitudes and sexual health needs of Pakistani, Indian and white secondary school children in Glasgow.* Submitted for the degree of Masters of Public Health, Department of Public Health, University of Glasgow. February 1997.

MIRZA, H. S. (1992) *Young, Female and Black* London, Routledge.

MIRZA, H. S. (1995) 'Black women in higher education: Defining a space/finding a place' in L. Morley and V. Walsh *Feminist Academics: Creative Agents for Change* London, Taylor and Francis.

MIRZA H. S. (1997) 'Black Women in Education: A Collective Movement for Change' in H. S. Mirza (ed) *Black British Feminism* London, Routledge.

MODOOD, T. (1993) The Number of Ethnic Minority Students in British Higher Education: Some Grounds for Optimism. *Oxford Review of Education*, Volume 19, No 2,

MORTIMORE, P., OWEN, C. and RATCLIFFE, P. (1997) 'Higher Education Qualifications', in Karn, V. Dale, A. and Ratcliffe, P. *op. cit.*

MUNN, P., CULLEN, M. A., JOHNSTONE, M. and LLOYD, G. (1997) Exclusions and in-school alternatives. *Interchange*, No 47, SOEID

MYERS, A. and BROWN, A. (1997) *Gender Equality in Scotland: a research review update* Researc[illegible]cussion Series No 19 Manchester: EOC

OFFICE FOR NATIONAL STATISTICS (1998) *Social Trends 28* London: The Stationery Office.

OFSTED (1996) *Recent Research on the Achievements of Ethnic Minority Pupils*, HMSO, London.

OPCS *General Household Survey for 1991.* Government Statistical Service, London.

OWEN, D. (1994) *Ethnic Minority Women and the Labour Market: Analysis of the 1991 Census* EOC Research Series, Manchester: EOC

PARSONS, C. (1996) Permanent Exclusions from Schools in England and in the 1990s: Trends, Causes and Responses, *Children and Society* 10:3.

PATERSON, L. (1992) 'Social class in Scottish Education' in BROWN, S. and RIDDELL, S. (ed) *op. cit.*

PEAL, E. AND LAMBERT, W.E. (1962): 'The relation of bilingualism to intelligence'. Psychological Monographs 76: 1-23.

PHILLIPS, A (1987) *Divided Loyalties: Dilemmas of sex and class* London: Virago

POWNEY, J and WATTS, M (1987) *Interviewing in Educational Research* London: Routledge & Kegan Paul

POWNEY, J and WEINER, G (1992) *Outside of the Norm: Equity and management in educational institutions.* London: South Bank University

POWNEY, J. WEINER, G. and HAMILTON, S. (1997) *Higher Education and Equality: a guide.* CRE/CVCP/EOC. Manchester: EOC.

POWNEY, J., CULLEN, M., SCHLAPP., GLISSOV., JOHNSTONE, M. and MUNN, P. (1996) *Understanding Values Education in the Primary School* Edinburgh: SCRE.

PRYCE, K. (1989) Endless Pressure: a study of West Indian life-styles in Bristol, *Bristorl Classical.*

RAMPTON, A. (1981) *West Indian Children in our Schools.* Cmnd. 8273 HMSO, London.

REES, P and PHILLIPS, D Geographical spread: the national picture in *Ethnicity in the 1991 Census, Volume Four, Social Geography and ethnicity in Britain: geographical spread, spatial concentration and internal migration* Office for National Statistics, London, The Stationery Office

REX J. and TOMLINSON, S. (1979) *Colonial Immigrants in a British City* London Routledge and Kegan Paul

RIDLEY, J and KENDRICK, A (1994) *Is Scotland Colour Blind? Race and research in Scotland* Seminar Series No5 Social Services Research Group, Scottish Branch.

ROBERTS, H. and SACHDEV, D. (1996) *Young People's Social Attitudes. Having their say – The views of 12-19 year olds.* Barnardos.

SARGANT, N. (1993) *Learning for a Purpose; participation in education and training by adults from ethnic minorities.* NIACE, Leicester.

SCOTTISH CONSULTATIVE COUNCIL ON THE CURRICULUM (1993) Equal Opportunities in Practice, SCCC Dundee.

SCOTTISH CONSULTATIVE COUNCIL ON THE CURRICULUM (1994) *School Climate and Ethos; Curriculum Conference Report* Aith Castle Hotel. March. SCCC.

SCOTTISH CONSULTATIVE COUNCIL ON THE CURRICULUM (SCCC) (1994): Languages for Life. Bilingual Pupils 5 - 14. Dundee. SCCC.

SCOTTISH EXAMINATIONS BOARD (1991) *Ethnic minority candidates in Examinations in English.* SEB.

SHARP, S. and FITZPATRICK, J. (1991): 'Attainment in examinations in English of ethnic minorities in Scotland'. New Community 17:2.

SIANN, G. (1984) 'Muslim Traditions and Attitudes to Female Education', *Journal of Adolescence*, Volume 7, pp 191-200

SIANN, G. (1990) *Parents, careers and culture, the view of ethnic majority and ethnic minority girls*, SEMRU, Research paper No 8.

SINGH-RAUD, H. (1990) 'Ethnic minority experience in Higher Education' in *Higher Education Quarterly*, Vol.44, No. 4, pp.344-359.

SINGH-RAUD, H. (1997): *The Educational Attitudes and Aspirations of Asian Girls*. PhD Thesis. Manchester Metropolitan University.

SIRAJ-BLATCHFORD, I (1993) *Race, Gender and the Education of Teachers* Buckingham Open University Press.

SMITH, Graeme (1998) 'City aims to combat racism in schools'. *Glasgow Herald* 22 January.

SOCIAL POLICY RESEARCH UNIT, LEEDS (1994) *Findings, the Provision of Social Security Benefits to Minority Ethnic Communities*, No 59, Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

SCOTTISH OFFICE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT *Guidelines for Teacher Training Courses* Edinburgh, Scottish Office

SCOTTISH OFFICE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT (1992a) *Using Performance Indicators in Primary School Self-Evaluation* HMI. Scottish Office.

SCOTTISH OFFICE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT (1992b) *Using Performance Indicators in Secondary School Self-Evaluation.* HMI. Scottish Office.

SCOTTISH OFFICE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT (1992c) *Using Ethos Indicators in Primary School Self-Evaluation; School development planning support materials.* HMI. Scottish Office.

SCOTTISH OFFICE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT (1992d) *Using Ethos Indicators in Secondary School Self-Evaluation; School development planning support materials.* HMI. Scottish Office.

SILLITOE, K and WHITE, P.H (1992) Ethnic group and the British Census: the search for a question *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society*, A, 155, Part I 141-53

SOLOMOS, J. (1989) *From Equal Opportunity to Anti-Racism: Racial Inequality and the Limits of Reform.* Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations. Policy Paper in Ethnic Relations No. 17. November. ESRC.

SOLOMOS, J. (1989) *Race Relations Research and Social Policy: A Review of Some Recent Debates and Controversies* Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations. Policy Papers in Ethnic Relations No. 18. November. ESRC.

STORAN, J. and GRETTON, R. (1993) *Progression to Higher Education: Developing Selection Criteria* London: TVEI/South Bank University.

TAYLOR, M. (1992) *Equality After ERA? Concerns and Challenges for Multiculural Antiracist Education* Slough NFER

TAYLOR, P. (1993) 'Minority ethnic groups and gender access to higher education *New Community*, 19 pp 425-40.

TES PRIMARY (1998) 'Keep a look out for 'invisible' behaviour'. The Centre for New Ethnicities Research, Essex (Pubs) 23 January.

The Provision of Languages other than English in Primary and Secondary Schools in Scotland. Dundee. SCCC.

THIARA, R. and GOULBOURNE, H. (1992) *Courses in Race and Ethnic Relations in Higher Education in Britain.* Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations. Occasional Papers in Ethnic Relations No. 8. August. ESRC.

THORPE, F., GALLACHER, L. and SIM, S. (1992): Providing English Language Support for speakers of other languages: a challenge and an opportunity for Scottish FE.

TROYNA, B. and BALL, W. (1987) *Views from the Chalk Face: School Responses to an LEA's Policy on Multicultural Education.* Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations. Policy Papers in Ethnic Relations No. 1. ESRC. Reprint. ESRC.

TROYNA, B. and EDWARDS, V. (1993) *The Educational Needs of a Multiracial Society.* Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations. Occasional Paper No. 9. April. ESRC.

TURNER, E., BROWN, S., MacLEOD, A. and RIDDELL, S (1996) *Women in Further Education Management in Scotland* Edinburgh: Scottish Office 1996 p59.

TURNER, E., RIDDELL, S and BROWN, S. (1995) *Gender Equality in Scottish Schools: The impact of recent educational reforms,* Manchester: EOC.

WALSH, D. (1987) *Racial harassment in Glasgow.* Glasgow. Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit.

WALSH, D., HAMPTON, K. and BAIN, J. (1995) *Increasing Access to Higher Education in Glasgow for Ethnic Minority Students Report 1. A Review of Literature and Statistics.* Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit Paper: No 6, Series 2. November.

WATTS, S (1996) '*Science Education for a Multicultural Society*' in ARORA, R. K and DUNCAN (eds), C. *op. cit.*

WITCHER, H. (1992) 'Turning a multi-cultural and anti-racist education policy into practice'. In Brown, S. and Riddell, S. (eds.): *op. cit.*

WOODROFFE, C., GLICKMANN, M., BARKER, M. and POWER, C. (1993) *Children, Teenagers and Health. The Key Data.* Buckingham Open University Press,.

WRENCH, J. and REID, E. (1990) *Race Relations Research in the 1990s. Mapping out an Agenda.* Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations. Occasional Paper in Ethnic Relations No. 5. February. ESRC.

WRIGHT, C. (1992) Early Education: multiracial primary school classrooms, in Gill, D., Mayor, B. and Blair, M. (eds) *op cit.*

ZIMET, S (1976) *Print and Prejudice* London Hodder.

Appendix A: Racial incidents recorded by the police

	1988	1989	1990	1991	1992	1993	1994	1995/6*	1996	1997
Central	9	18	45	69	51	52	75	125	105	114
Dumfries & Galloway	—	—	—	—	—	4	6	2	4	5
Fife	—	—	3	35	30	20	40	44	53	33
Grampian	4	4	9	4	20	28	44	25	37	56
Lothian & Borders	89	91	178	213	184	229	266	288	287	311
Northern	—	—	—	—	—	1	0	1	0	8
Strathclyde	197	236	300	254	250	229	225	230	206	461
Tayside	—	27	101	103	128	193	135	117	119	105
TOTAL	**299**	**376**	**636**	**678**	**663**	**756**	**791**	**832**	**811**	**1093**

Source: Figures provided by Commision for Racial Equality Scotland.

* 1995/6 was a 15 month reporting period.
Note: 1997 figures have just been received and are not yet validated.

Appendix B: Grades of Staff from Different Ethnic Groups

Female academics by ethnicity:	Professors	Lower grades
Black	0%	1.2%
Asian	0.6%	3.6%
White	98.6%	93.3%
Other	0.8%	1.8%

Male academics by ethnicity:	Professors	Lower grades
Black	0.2%	1.1%
Asian	1.4%	5.0%
White	97.2%	91.9%
Other	1.1%	2.0%

Women account for 8.8% of all professional and 35.3% of other academic posts.

Note: All figures are derived by the THES from HESA Staff Data, 1996-97. All proportions relate only to staff of known ethnicity. HESA advises that information about professional appointments is based on data by grade within institutions and as such may not represent the sector as a whole.
Source: The Times Higher, June 5 1998

The Scottish Council for Research in Education

'Research in the service of education' is the motto of the Scottish Council for Research in Education. For over 60 years it has put this into action through carrying out research studies in schools and other institutions across the educational system at all levels from pre-school to adult and vocational education. It also provides a range of associated research, information and communication services. SCRE aims to make documents arising from its own research available to those who are interested. Reports in the Project Report series are not specially prepared for publication. Enquiries about SCRE publications are welcome and should be directed to Information Services.

RESEARCH
INFORMATION
EVALUATION
CONSULTANCY
for EDUCATION

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

SCRE 99